Empirical Framework

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion 0

The Complexity Yield Puzzle: A Textual Analysis of Municipal Bond Disclosures

Michael Farrell,¹ Dermot Murphy,² Marcus Painter,³ and Guangli Zhang³

¹University of Wisconsin - Milwaukee, ²University of Illinois - Chicago, ³Saint Louis University

Brookings 12th Annual Municipal Finance Conference July 19, 2023

Information Disclosure in Financial Markets

• Well functioning markets require clear communication between investors and those seeking funds. Disclosures play an important role. The optimal level of disclosure can depend on investor clientele

Information Disclosure in Financial Markets

• Well functioning markets require clear communication between investors and those seeking funds. Disclosures play an important role. The optimal level of disclosure can depend on investor clientele





- PM at Muni-bond mutual fund
- Has team of analysts
- Extensive professional investing experience



- Works in medical equipment sales
- Limited time
- Invests on the side

Main Results

With straightforward disclosure, most investor types will be able to process



TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY STATEMENT	
INTRODUCTION	
AUTHORITY AND SECURITY FOR THE BONDS	
THE SERIES 2022 BONDS	
THE PROJECT	
TAN LEVY AND COLLECTION PROCEDURES	
CITY OF STILLWATER	
INDEBTEDNESS.	
FINANCIAL INFORMATION	
AUDITORS' REPORT AND FINANCIAL STATEMENTS	
TAX EXEMPTION	
GLOBAL HEALTH EMERGENCY RISK	
LEGAL MATTERS	
CONTINUING DISCLOSURE AGREEMENT	
ABSENCE OF MATERIAL LITIGATION	
UNDERWRITING	
BOND INSURANCE	
BOND INSURANCE RISK FACTORS	
CREDIT RATINGS	
FINANCIAL ADVISOR	
MISCELLANEOUS	
CERTIFICATION AS TO OFFICIAL STATEMENT	
EXHIBITS	
A Dubt Service Schedule	

B – City of Stilbuster, Oklahoma Annual Comprehensive Financial Report and Accompanying Independent Auditors' Report Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2021

C - Form of Band Counsel Opinion

D - Form of Continuing Disclosure Agreemen

E - Specimen Municipal Bond Invarance Policy



Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion O

With complex disclosure, unsophisticated investor types will struggle



TABL	LOF C	ONTENTS	
	Page		
TROPACING		Red Law	
I AUTHORITY	_	Channel he a	
R CHTY		Selection 2 and 2	
AN OF PERMICENCI		CERTMETAN	
TRAFFIC MERCER AND LNES OF PLNCS.		BLUCTOR UT	
BT MRNKE RECEIREMENTS FOR THE		General	
144 80505		Environment	
INCREPTION OF THE MALE BOARDS		Federal En-	-
War 2016A Burah		1984 8-10	
Exchange. Transfer and Replacement of Bende		Energy Pul	
Radomptica Perchanas		Chin Airi	
Perchese at Any Time		Publice	
Book Eatry Only Epitom		National A	
EXBITY FOR THE BOADS	- 49	New hours	
Photos of the Trust Estate		Coloraritado	
Debt Service Rolend Fund		Pyranimia	18
Rev Crystell		CERTAINTA	6.94
Sales Tax Agreement		3044A BONER	
Addronal Bonds	- 11	Fodoral but	~
Sales Tas Revenue	- 55 -	State Tatan	
Londord and Sportal Obligations	- 55 -	Organd In	
a sveres	- 55	Corganal Fe	- 1
Chief Schematers	- 55 -	Address 1	
Kath and Charges	-12	Charges in	
THE RECEIPTION	- 55	CONCERNMENT.	
The Water Spores	-8		
The New of New of Street, Stre		NULTIFIATE	29
when and when when the of service and then			
Cough youry for the water and waterwater		CONTRACTOR OF	
Contraction of the second of the second seco		COLUMN TWO IS	
Transfer and the second states and the second states.	14	NUMBER OF A DESCRIPTION	
Repaired Results of Operations	- 12	CURTUR AT	22
I have fired Facilied Britada of Characterian Factors		(100)000,000	
Fixed Your Nild			
Projected Financial Performance	11	APPENDIX A	- 0
THEN INDERVICEMENT OF THE ALTROPOTY			- 54
TALL OF BUILDING COMMAND		APPENDIX N	
Read of Million International	- 64		- 12
Lonited Endorscencer Rights and Security for the			- 2
Buch	- 10		
Finandal Information	- 50	APPENDECC	
Factors Related to Construction and Operation of the Pactors			- 11
Factors Roboted to the Electric United Industry	14	APPENDEX D	
Federal Tax, Status of the 20144 Bonds			
Exceptionary Mandatory Rodowarius of the 2014A		CONTRACTOR OF	
Reads to Maintain Federal Tax Excerption		APPENDIX C	
Secondary Mader		APPENDER F	



More is not always more (Miller, 2010; Lawrence, 2013; Blankespoor et al, 2020)

Main Results

Conclusior 0

Information in Municipal Primary Markets

- The \$4.2 trillion muni market's historical creditworthiness has allowed it to enjoy lax disclosure regulation
 - Unlike public firms, munis do not follow a standardized disclosure policy
 - The SEC has become increasingly vocal about its desire to enhance municipal disclosure
 - Local gov officials and underwriters fear muni disclosure regulation will be too burdensome
- A market with predominantly individual investors can suffer from too much complexity due to burdensome information processing costs

= THE BOND BUYER

SEC enforcement actions emphasize issuers, MAs

By Connor Hussey July 27, 2022, 2:58 p.m. EDT 3 Min Read

THE WALL STREET JOURNAL.

MARKETS | FINANCIAL REGULATION

Local Governments, Many on Wall Street Line Up Against Muni-Data Bill

Effort to improve transparency by requiring machine-readable financial disclosures raises hackles

By <u>Heather Gillers</u> Follow Nov. 26, 2022 7:00 am ET

Empirical Framework

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Research Questions

- How does the complexity of municipal official statements (OS) affect the allocation of capital?
 - Complexity Yield Premium driven by bonds with high retail presence and less complementary information
 - In secondary market, complexity increases volatility and markup differential between retail and institutional investors
- How has the complexity of OS's evolved over time?
 - Steady increase in complexity, driven by regulatory oversight and catering to institutions (Bergstresser et al., 2016)

Main Results



Main Results

O

Municipal Bond Official Statements

"Investors and other market participants have long criticized the quality, consistency, and timeliness of the disclosures provided by municipal issuers."

- Former SEC Commissioner Luis Aguilar, Feb 2015.

• Municipalities are required to distribute an OS prior to issuing any new bond

- Typical contents amount, maturities, credit rating, source of repayment and their security, sources and uses of funds
- Access to these statements has benefited retail investors, on average (Cuny, 2018)
- The OS must be "complete" an investor should not have to research the bonds beyond what is available in the OS
- We collect the universe of OS's from EMMA (mid-2009 to 2019) and merge with primary market issuance data from Mergent at the bond issuance level
 - 85,317 statements covering >1mm bonds

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion O

Measuring Complexity

- We create a composite index of complexity using commonly used measures from the finance (Loughran and McDonald, 2014) and linguistics (Wang et al. 2022) literature
 - Number of Pages, Word Count, Flesch-Kincaid, Gunning-Fog, Auto Readability, Coleman-Liau, Linsear-Write, and Smog Index:

$$ex: \textit{ Flesch Kincaid} = 0.39 \times \frac{\textit{total words}}{\textit{total sentences}} + 11.8 \times \frac{\textit{total syllables}}{\textit{total words}} - 15.59$$

	Mean	Median	P25	P75	SD
Number of Pages	135.4	118.0	81.0	169.0	89.8
Number of Words (000)	63.4	48.8	26.8	80.3	57.3
Flesch-Kincaid Grade	20.2	18.9	16.1	22.7	6.6
Gunning Fog Grade	21.0	19.7	17.0	23.5	6.7
Observations	85,317				

Empirical Framework

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion O

Complexity Excerpt

"If available moneys in the Debt Service Fund after any required transfers from the Debt Service Reserve Fund and Redemption Fund are not sufficient on any day to pay all principal (including sinking fund installments), redemption price and interest on the Outstanding Bonds then due or overdue, such moneys (other than any sum in the Redemption Fund irrevocably set aside for the redemption of particular Bonds or required to purchase Bonds under outstanding purchase contracts) shall, after payment of all charges and disbursements of the Trustee in accordance with the Agreement, be applied (in the order such Funds are named in this section) first to the payment of interest, including interest on overdue principal, in the order in which the same became due (pro rata with respect to interest which became due at the same time), and second to the payment of principal (including sinking fund installments) and redemption premiums, if any, without regard to the order in which the same became due (in proportion to the amounts due)."

MASSACHUSETTS HEALTH AND EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES AUTHORITY REVENUE BONDS, MASSACHUSETTS EYE AND EAR INFIRMARY ISSUE SERIES C (2010) (MA)

Page Count: 190 Word Count: 96,825 Readability grade level: 23.6 Complexity index: 1.2

Main Results

Does Official Statement Complexity Affect Issuance Costs?

Yield $Spread_{i,t} = \beta \cdot Complexity_{it} + \gamma \cdot X_{it} + State \times Year FE_{sy} + \varepsilon_{it}$

- Bond issue *i*, issuance date *t*, state *s*, year *y*
- *Yield Spread*_{*i*,*t*} is the within-issue value-weighted average difference between the offering yield of each bond and the coupon-equivalent risk-free rate

	Mean	Median	Std. Dev.
Yield Spread (%)	0.354	0.247	0.623

• Bond and County Controls – unemployment rate, population, issue size, maturity, negotiated, callable, insured, credit rating, GO



Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Full sample average of 4.9bps is 7.9% of yield spread standard deviation

5.1% of average credit spread between AAA and BBB bonds

Issuances w/ a disclosure complexity level ≥ 0.5 standard deviations above average paid \$1.4 billion more in agg. interest payments



Empirical Framewor

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Full sample average of 4.9bps is 7.9% of yield spread standard deviation

5.1% of average credit spread between AAA and BBB bonds

Issuances w/ a disclosure complexity level ≥ 0.5 standard deviations above average paid \$1.4 billion more in agg. interest payments



Empirical Framework

Main Results

What Drives the Complexity-Yield Premium?

- The complexity-yield premium depends on the share of unsophisticated investors in the market Look at settings where retail participation varies.
 - 1. Bonds issued in states with low/no tax privilege less incentive for local retail investors to dominate market (Babina et al 2019)
 - 2. Bank Qualified bonds higher participation by banks (Dagostino, 2022)
 - 3. Bonds with "High Price" less likely to trigger de minimus threshold and thus more attractive to mutual funds (Bagley, Gissler, Hiteshew, and Ivanov 2023)
 - 4. Negotiated bonds have special window for retail participation in primary market
- The complexity-yield depends on the level of complementary information from external sources
 - 1. Examine subsample regressions by credit rating bins. Low and unrated bonds will have less complementary info and worse signal precision (Cornaggia et al., 2018)
 - 2. Revenue bonds. Less historical info (relative to GOs).

Empirical Framework

Main Results

What Drives the Complexity-Yield Premium?

- The complexity-yield premium depends on the share of unsophisticated investors in the market Look at settings where retail participation varies.
 - 1. Bonds issued in states with low/no tax privilege less incentive for local retail investors to dominate market (Babina et al 2019)
 - 2. Bank Qualified bonds higher participation by banks (Dagostino, 2022)
 - 3. Bonds with "High Price" less likely to trigger de minimus threshold and thus more attractive to mutual funds (Bagley, Gissler, Hiteshew, and Ivanov 2023)
 - 4. Negotiated bonds have special window for retail participation in primary market
- The complexity-yield depends on the level of complementary information from external sources
 - 1. Examine subsample regressions by credit rating bins. Low and unrated bonds will have less complementary info and worse signal precision (Cornaggia et al., 2018)
 - 2. Revenue bonds. Less historical info (relative to GOs).



Complexity Premium is Moderated when Inst'l Investors are more Present



Baseline Complexity Yield Premium is 0.049

Main Results

The Complexity Premium is Highest for Low and Unrated Issues



Baseline Complexity Yield Premium is 0.049. Revenue bonds also have higher premium (see paper).

Motivation	Empirical Framework	Main Results	The Complexity Puzzle	Conclusion
000000	0000	0000	00000	0

Official Statements have Steadily Increased in their Complexity (Puzzling!)

- Given complexity is costly on average, issuers should be aiming to simplify OS's.
 What are the time trends?
- Graph shows how complexity changes through our sample



Empirical Framewor

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion O

Dissecting Complexity

- **Catering Hypothesis:** Complexity may be increasing in subsets of bonds that cater to institutions
 - We find some evidence of this for states with no tax privilege (see paper)
- **Regulatory Burden Hypothesis:** Increased regulatory burden (without standardized guide) may pressure munis to put more detail/complexity into OS

Main Results

Is Complexity Increasing for Munis with Higher Regulatory Burden?

- Use increase in SEC enforcement workers during 2015-2017 regulatory push
 - During Chair Mary Jo White's enforcement push, the number of enforcement officers in regional offices increased by 70%, on average
 - Large regional variation Boston increased by 150%, Fort Worth by 9%

$$Complexity_{i,t} = \sum_{y=2009}^{y=2019} eta' (High \ Enforcement_i imes Year_t)$$

$$+\gamma \cdot X_{it} + State FE_s + \varepsilon_{it}$$

• *High Enforcement* = 1 if muni is in the state of a regional office with above median growth in enforcement workers



U.S. SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION

Speech

A New Model for SEC Enforcement: Producing Bold and Unrelenting Results

Chair Mary Jo White

New York University School of Law Program on Corporate Compliance and Enforcement
New York University School of Law Pollack Center for Law and Business

Nov. 18, 2016



Complexity is Increasing in States with Higher Regulatory Burden



Main Results

Where is Complexity the most problematic within an OS?

- OS's are not standardized and therefore do not follow a common table of contents
- Use Latent Dirichlet Allocation (LDA) to discover the "topics" within an OS
 - LDA classifies each portion of a document in terms of how relevant it is to each discovered topic
 - Manually assign these topics to groups based on relevance within the municipal disclosure

LDA Topic Examples		
Risk	Bond Description	
Security, Risk, Fund Liability, Deferred, Resource Default, Event, Trustee	Redemption, Bond, Date Project, Improvement, Capital Bond, Price, Discount	
Cashflow	Legal	
Budget, Appropriation, Year Expense, Fee, Cost Fund, Investment, Portfolio	Mean, Resolution, Shall Authority, Finance, Resolution Bond, Opinion, Counsel	

Empirical Frameworl

Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion O

LDA Topic Regression Results



Main Results

The Complexity Puzzle

Conclusion

Conclusion

- The cost of complexity in municipal disclosure varies based on investor clientele.
 - Complexity is bad for cost of capital, volatility, and liquidity if there are more unsophisticated investors, but can be helpful if there are more sophisticated investors

- Puzzlingly, official statements have become increasingly complex, at the cost of higher muni financing expenses
 - Increased regulatory burden appears to be an important channel. Catering to institutions is also relevant.