THE BROOKINGS INSTITUTION WEBINAR

BOLSTERING AFRICA'S GREEN TRANSITIONS: THE ROLE OF AN AFRICAN-EUROPEAN PARTNERSHIP

Washington, D.C. Monday, June 14, 2021

PARTICIPANTS:

Moderator:

ALOYSIUS UCHE ORDU Senior Fellow and Director, Africa Growth Initiative The Brookings Institution

Presenter:

FATIMA DENTON
Director, Institute for Natural Resources in Africa at
The United National University (UNU-INRA)

Panel:

JEAN-PAUL ADAM

Director for Technology, Climate Change and Natural Resource Management United Nations Economic Commission for Africa

HONORABLE LEFOKO MOAGI

Minister

Botswana Ministry for Mineral Resources, Green Technology & Energy Security

HARSEN NYAMBE

Head of Division -- Environment, Climate Change, Water and Land Management, DREA African Union Commission

VANESSA USHIE

Manager, Policy Analysis Division at the African National Resources Centre African Development Bank

JÜRGEN KARL ZATTLER

Director General

German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development

PROCEEDINGS

MR. ORDU: Good morning to our listeners in Africa, here in the United States, and from around the world. My name is Aloysius Ordu. I'm a senior fellow, here, at the Brookings Institution, and director of the African Growth Initiative. I'm particularly delighted to welcome you all to today's event, titled, "Bolstering Africa's green transitions: The role of an African-European partnership."

Climate change is, by far, the most consequential challenge we face in the world today. The situation is getting worse and has been further compounded by the ravages of COVID-19. Many books and research materials have been produced on the devastating impacts of climate change. The question remains, what is the world doing about it? Are we doing enough?

Today, on this special occasion, to celebrate Africa's Climate Week, we are delighted to join forces with United Nations University Institute for Natural Resources in Africa, based in Accra, Ghana. They will share with us the outcome of recent work they've done on climate change, and global collaboration is particularly important to address climate crisis. Dr. Fatima Denton is the director of the United Nations Institute. She will present the findings of their recent research, on how Europe and Africa can collaborate to address climate crisis.

Dr. Denton's presentation will be followed by a discussion, by a panel of experts, from the EU, and three experts from Africa's premiere institutions, The African Union Commission, The African Development Bank, and UNECA, based in Addis Ababa. For the audience members who wish to pose questions to us today, we encourage you to do so, by sending your request, by Tweeting #GreenTransitions. Let's get started.

Please join me and bid warm welcome to Dr. Fatima Denton, to present the findings and recommendations of this study. Thank you very much.

MS. DENTON: Thank you. Thank you very much, Dr. Ordu. Can you hear me, and hopefully see me? Okay. Thank you. Let me start with a very important part of it, which is the salutations. We are particularly honored to have with us, the Admirable Minister -- Minister Lefoko Moagi, who is the minister for Mineral Resources, Green Technology, and Energy of the Republic of Botswana. I'm delighted to have you, Honorable Minister.

I'm also very happy to have Dr. Jurgen Zattler from BMZ, Federal Ministry of Economic

Cooperation and Development of Germany. Thank you very much, Dr. Zattler, we're particularly delighted that BMZ enabled this project to take place, and we are going to be doing the -- I mean, presenting the findings. I'm also happy to have the three representatives from UNECA, Dr. Jean-Paul Adam, from African Union Commission, Dr. Nyambe, and also my sister, from the African Development Bank, Miss Vanessa Ushie. So, really great to have you all with us today. I'm delighted, also, to be partnering with Brookings Institute, through the African Growth Initiative. Thank you very much, again, Dr. Aloysius Ordu.

So, let me get straight into it. There are quite a number of slides, so, I'm going to try to kind of navigate my way through this, so that I do not monopolize the discussions today. We've called this the Bridges of Opportunity because when we started the study, we realized that we do need to have - to think through EU-Africa relationship, in the context of a green recovery. We needed to think about it through opportune -- a very strong opportunity narrative. Next slide.

So, in terms of the content of the presentation, I'm going to give you a very quick context because context matters. In that, I think I would like to talk to you about the Africa-EU Partnership, would also like to talk about trade and investment, very quickly, and also what I see as opportunities, and what comes out of the presentation, rather, as opportunities. Then, we'll talk about the greening of, you know, Africa's greening, in terms of a green recovery. We've used the word induced, so, those of you know what induction means, especially if you're a woman, and you have to be inducted, you can see how painful this can be sometimes. But, literally, that's what it needs to be. Then, we're also going to talk about key messages and recommendations. Next slide.

So, just general observations. I think, the first one is to say that Africa is green. This is a green field. We are less than 5 percent, in terms of our carbon footprint. Also, important to say that we live, currently, with some COVID -- not least because of COVID, in a very turbulent world, a turbulent world that has made the future even more uncertain, with the climate change and some of the other spoilers that you know about. And, therefore, we would need to better prepare ourselves, and in this preparation, there are different departure points. We're not all at the same level. And this would obviously warrant a new business model. We are arguing that the current business model that we have, which is greatly centralized on fossil fuel, is probably a little bit outdated. And so, we need to look at what

analogs are there, that we can tap into. Next slide.

So, there are a number of disruptors. And the first disruptor is the current -- our current reality. And this is a reality, that we're all going through. COVID-19 is the first time we've had a recession in 25 years. We've seen the decline in the economic growth of many countries, a decline in many countries, in global decline, I would say, in terms of economic growth. But, also, just to say that there is already -- the world is witnessing GDP Loss.

In Africa, in particular, there are problems related to fiscal deficits. Many countries rely on their energy resources, and these resources, because of demand, are no longer in the kind of supply that there were before. In addition to that, we're also seeing a growing indebtedness. Many countries already had problems, and that problem is now worse. So, in general, we are seeing economic and social malaise. Seven out of the world's -- seven of the world's ten countries, that are the most vulnerable to climate change, are in Africa. I think Dr. Ordu mentioned that climate change isn't existentially straight.

So, apart from COVID, another one of those disruptors is the climate change phenomenon, which Africa is particular vulnerable to, and more or less because of the fact that the country doesn't have the right tools and right arsenal, in terms of its adaptation potential. It is losing quite a lot already, in terms of climate change impacts, and this is going to get worse. Next slide.

Again, just to give you a sense of what these impacts are, it is projected in west and east Africa, that the continent -- these regions could lose up to 15 percent of their GDP. I think you all know that Africa relies very heavily on its natural resources. Agriculture is a key sector, and this is a sector that is going to be in the frontline, in terms of climate change impacts. So, a total loss -- we're looking at a loss of at least 15 percent of GDP because most of the staples, that Africa relies on, is coming from a sector like agriculture, whether it's coffee in Ethiopia, or cocoa in Ghana, but these are sensitive sectors, which is why we call them climate sensitive sectors.

The Arena International Renewable Energy Agency estimated, of Africa's renewable energy transformation, it would require about 70 billion in dollars. So, not only are we faced with a problem related to climate change impacts, but, if we want to power our growth, we need renewable energy in huge supplies. We do have this. Many countries are rich in renewable energy, but do not have

the right tools and the financing muscle to be able to leverage the renewable energy potential that they

have. Next slide.

So, why does a green transformation matter? Or why does a green recovery matter?

And we will basically talk about the EU-Africa Partnership. Most of you would have known that EU has

got an EU Green Deal. It's not a new thing, but it's relatively new, if you'd like. But there is even greater

urgency, now, that this has to be something that we must promote because of the fact that, for most,

some of the reasons I mentioned already, Africa is very sensitive to climate change shocks, and even

more sensitive when we, you know, with the COVID-19, we have seen how sensitive the continent is.

So, the EU Green Deal, in many ways, is a catalyst because it provides a rationale of

why Africa needs to diversify its economy, but also needs to find ways of ensuring that it's protecting itself

against a lot of these shocks, some of which we are still going through. It's also very important because

the EU cannot go towards carbon neutrality without Africa. And this might seem like a bold statement to

make, but it's -- actually is true, that Africa trades quite a lot with EU, and, therefore, Africa's fugitive

emissions could be EU's abatement problem.

So, the EU will definitely need Africa, in terms of implementing its Green Deal. Africa has

the tool. I mean, we could even go as far as saying that Africa can lead on a green development, but

support is needed, and we can look into the support, as we go through this presentation. Next slide.

The EU is Africa's greatest partner. I think that point's already been made. Africa trades quite a

lot with EU. This was study that was done by Brookings Institute, that was basically saying that 30-70

percent of Africa's trade is with the EU. So, it's quite a significant chunk. Next slide, so we can go a bit

faster.

It is actually quite fortunate that Africa has got the African Continental Free Trade Area,

which is the largest trading block, and this is connecting 1.3 million people, 55 countries in Africa, and the

potential GDP of \$3.4 trillion. So, this is something that could also help, as a vehicle to facilitate trade

between Africa and the EU. Next slide.

And, again, just another point to mention, that the EU is Africa's largest source, in terms

of foreign direct investment. Europe's 221 billion of FDR is actually in Africa. So, it's, again, another

significance to the space. Now, there are sectors that we think are very strong potential. We actually

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 1800 Diagonal Road, Suite 600 Alexandria, VA 22314

look to this study, under three main sectors. So, you could tell a three-tailed story, if you like. The first

one is energy, and for that we think that energy is a no-brainer. And it's the barometer of development,

and so, focusing on energy, I think, would be really useful, in terms of a green transformation, not least

because we could look at our supply chains, the way in which we can produce, and how we can improve

our productive capacity.

Energy is connected to transport. So, movement of people, and goods, and services are

going to be fundamentally important. Again, energy can also help power agriculture production systems.

Some of them are quite out of date and would need a radical overhaul. So, in terms of food systems,

food security and nutrition, these are all going to be very important. Infrastructure, I'm sure our colleague

from the Bank would also talk about this, an equally important area where greening can occur. Next

slide.

Cities are going to be essentially going to be quite essential in Africa's green

transformation. Our cities are not all well planned. We've got mega cities, and, in addition to that, we

also are a very, sort of, rapidly organizing region. And you can see, from the statistics, how we have

grown from 1950 to 2015, and now. So, this is going to be both an opportunity and a problem, and you'd

see the details later. Next slide.

Again, a point I mentioned. The continent will grow, especially in 2050, 2.3 billion, in

terms of people. Most of our population are very rural, they're still very rural, so the dependence on off

grid would be fundamentally important, especially if you want to widen energy access and make it a bit

more inclusive. Next slide.

And this is just an example to give you a sense of what is happening in other countries, in

Morocco and Namibia, there are countries that are already, I would say, staging a mini revolution, in

terms of energy transition. The Morocco, Namibia, we did a study, where we found that, in addition to our

energy potential, we are also a home to strategic minerals. Africa is host to 42 out of the 62 elements,

some of which are going to be quite important to power renewable energy and to scaling it up, as well.

Next slide.

And, again, just to say that, you know, in terms of just the potential that we have, we have

two thirds of the world's cobalt production, very important, 80 percent of platinum, manganese, but a lot of

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 1800 Diagonal Road, Suite 600 Alexandria, VA 22314

these has been focused on our potential, and we haven't actually talked about how we implement some of these things. So, I think, Africa needs to go beyond what it has, to what it can do with these resources. So, very important that we also put a lot of emphasis on what the resources can do, rather than just on the resources that we have. Next slide.

How do we induce greening? You heard me say that this was, literally, about an induction. You have to literally make this happen. Decarbonization, yes, we are already quite green, but we will not stay green, and, therefore, we need to shift to low carbon technologies. We need to diversify our revenue streams. We can't just rely on hydrocarbon resources. These are going to become stranded. We saw some of the problems we had with COVID-19, where supply chains were broken.

So, we literally have to also walk away from this potential or rather the reality of just focusing on one revenue. Democratization is going to be important. I'm sure the Honorable Minister would have something to say. It's important that we look at Africa's youth and see how we can better provide jobs that will be important for the African youth, which is a huge bonus to the continent, but, at the same time, they tend to be forgotten. They are almost on the periphery of development. Decentralization is going to be important. We focus on the urban, but we also have to look at the rural ports. I said 50 of the Africa's population is still rural. Digitalization, we know that the COVID-19 has actually made more evidence, the importance of the digital connectivity, one, to leverage jobs to increase our productive capacity, but also to make our economies more competitive. Next slide.

So, these are just some examples, to say, green is actually not a novel experience.

There are initiatives, that are already in Africa, that concerns greening, The AU Great Green Wall, and I'm sure we can talk about this later. There's also the fact that we are hoping that, with a green transformation, will come the creation of jobs, jobs for the youth, but jobs also, in general, for Africa population. Next slide.

There are some key messages in this report. Key messages that are important. Number one, that COVID is a reminder, that we need to start building buffers, and I've mentioned how very vulnerable and how very fragile our economies are. We know some of the known risks, like climate change, but there is a lot we don't know. So, how do we ensure that we've got the relevant muscle to be able to protect ourselves from, you know, (audio skip) and crises, like COVID-19. Secondly, green

transition has to be homegrown. Yes, I mentioned the EU Green Deal, but we can't follow. Africa sometimes has a tendency to follow. We have to ensure that this homegrown, and it's indigenously owned. Next slide.

Next slide. We definitely are a continent that needs to build forward better. It's not about build back better but we need to build forward better. So, this means we have to move towards high growth pathway, but that would mean that we have to leave aside some of the brown economy, and move towards, you know, carbon neutrality, sometimes a big word, for Africa, but we literally have to work towards a low carbon development. Also, important to say, that there is a deliberate choice that we have to make.

Some of this is already in the Africa Agenda 2063, but we also have to realize that green transition is not going to be easy. It's not a linear pathway, that we're just going to have to take. There will be some, you know, navigating through these different bumps and speed bumps, I'm sure. If you can compare it to a road analogy. But it's not going to easy. It's not going to be a linear process. Next slide.

Economic diversification, as I mentioned, is very important. It's also very important to think about Africa's -- how does Africa do this? The sequencing, the pace, the scale? These are all things that are going to be fundamentally important. Again, like I said, we cannot follow, but we also have to ensure that if we are going towards a low carbon development, that this is a managed exit. You know, we have to manage the exit because, as I said, we are not all at the same level. Next slide.

Again, importance, that we focus on the quality of the transition. Yes, the EU and other continents are talking about the importance of fast mitigation, not least because the impacts of climate change, but we can't also do fast mitigation at all cost because this will have consequences, especially for a continent that is still developing. So, we -- it has -- Africa cannot take its own time as well. It has to go a little bit faster.

But it also has to manage its space, but important to say, that we can't sacrifice a justice transition, for just -- the main purpose of getting to the transition. Justice is going to fundamentally important. The quality of the transition is going to be important. And in the quality, to say, very quickly, International Financial Institutions have a key role to play. Strategic partnership, like the one with the EU, will have a key role to play, in terms of capacity building and technology support. Next slide.

And to say that this relationship with the EU, it hasn't been plain sailing. That would be a bit of a, you know, an untruth, if we said that. But there has been many things that have worked. These are two continents that have a long history of working together. They've got geography, they've got history, they've got trade. But there are perceptions asymmetrical relationship. There are issues around the carbon boarder tax, that would necessitate that Africa can work its way through. And what the EU does, in terms of building trust, is also going to be more fundamentally important. Our perception about natural gas, the role of natural gas would play, in terms of our industrial development, is also going to be important, as well as how we manage fossil fuel because this can lead to stranded assets. Next slide.

Our recommendations, very quickly, there are a couple of recommendations. Science, technology and innovations, these are still growing, very important in a continent like ours, where science is very often, you know, undervalued. Sustainable human development, very important. We have 50 percent of the population that are women, and sometimes left behind. And this needs to be corrected. Sustainable habitats and biodiversity, sustainable infrastructure, all of these are going to be fundamentally important, as well as the way we produce and consume, as well, in terms of the low carbon and energy efficient manner. Next slide.

Important that in the way we think about the recovery, that we do not -- you know, Africa is not more or less forced to do too many things. You know, forced on the one hand, to go -- on the one hand, to go towards a green recovery. On the other hand, to manage its debt. On the other hand, to deal with fiscal recovery, or fiscal discipline. You know, very, very important that, you know, we manage this, and that Africa receives the support that it needs. As I mentioned, green cannot become the enemy of the just. Important that we ensure that if we are going to go green, that we have to do this in a just transition manner.

The AU-EU relationship, there is a lot there, but there is a sense that it needs to reset. It needs a reset. We need to recalibrate the relationship, in a way, that would enable it to work better. As I mentioned, we have to own the deal, at our own pace, and our own scale, but, you know, we can't take forever doing that, as well. Smart incentives are going to be important, investment, financing, using the NDCs. All of these are going to be fundamentally important, and we can leverage on the Africa Continental Free Trade, as well.

The three things that I mentioned, energy, cities and land, are going to be fundamental drivers to the green transformation. So, in essence, this is what our report is talking about. I'm sorry it's taking a bit longer, but I needed to it a bit of justice, as well. Thank you very much.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very much, Dr. Denton. There are clearly no easy answers to climate crisis. If there were, we would have found them by now. What is quite clear, listening to the presentation, is that solidarity and collaboration, between Africa and Europe, will be important, as we move forward to finding lasting solutions to the climate crisis we face.

Let's now turn to our panel. As I mentioned earlier, we do have five distinguished panelists. We have the Honorable Minister Lefoko Moagi of Botswana Ministry of Energy. We do have a Mr. Jurgen Karl Zattler, the Director General of the German Federal Ministry of Economic Corporation and Development. We have Simplice Nouala, Head of the Agriculture and Food Security Division of the African Union Commission. We have Ms. Vanessa Ushie, Manager of the Policy Analysis Division, African Natural Resources Center, at the African Development Bank. And then we also have Mr. Jean-Paul Adam, who is the Director of Technology, Climate Change, and Natural Resources Management, at the United Nations Economic Commissions for Africa.

What I would like us to do, now, is to go one by one, three minutes each, our panelists will react to what they've heard, and then we switch to a session where we will have question and answers, to the panel, and then, ultimately, open it up to our listeners, in Africa, in the United States, and around the world. First of all, Honorable Minister, over to you. Your feedback, comments, very quickly, ten minutes -- I meant three minutes, rather, on what you heard in the presentation.

MINISTER MOAGI: Thank you, Mr. Moderator. You put me on a tight spot because I don't know where to start. I've got a speech, and I've got questions that I hoping that these are the ones that I deal with. So, I seek your indulgence there, where do you want me to start?

MR. ORDU: Any quick reaction to what you heard, in the presentation. We'll go to the questions later.

MINISTER MOAGI: Okay. Okay, great, yeah, thank you so much. Yes, it is, indeed, gratifying, and thanks for the opportunity to also be here, and part of this, especially that, even as Botswana, we are transition towards the low carbon development offering issues at our economic growth,

the resilience and sustainable futures, that we believe will actually direct and traverse our transformation agenda.

We have -- obviously, we are signatory to the Prairie Agreement, and we have set ourselves a target of 50 percent emissions reductions, by 2030. So, this compels us to any transformation pathways that are being discussed, so that we can see how we achieve those as quickly as we can get to that, and we, obviously, from the party agreements, the international panels of climate change, we get those briefings, and we sure use them, also, when we developed our 20-year integrated resource plan, that IRP that we launched in December 2020. Essentially, this is just for electricity generation, and it seeks to just getting our projects going forward, in terms of renewable energies. And if I may highlight, just in the first seven years, we've got 100 megawatt solar PV. We've got 35 megawatts glitch type solar PVs.

All of these are coming in directions. They're already at concurrent stage, to be operational by 2022, and the commercial operation of 100 megawatts COVID meeting, and this is also already at the procurement stage, to happen by 2025. The 200 megawatts of concentrated solar power, which is also coming in 2026, but the procurement and the (inaudible) has started already, at this point. And we're also going into wind power, 50 megawatts, that is already being done, and we are currently just crystalizing our studies, in terms of wind studies, and satellite data, in some parts of the country, where this thing can be properly sited with the better wind speeds and capacities.

And then, further on, we've got another 100 solar PV, by 2027, and 400 mega solar power generation, beyond 2080, after 2040. We recently signed a memorandum of intent, with the Republic of Namibia, and the United States of America, to develop between two and five gigawatt mega solar projects for the two countries. This will actually help to bring a lot more homes under renewable power, and it will also assist countries, like Botswana, not just to be net importer, but also to be an exporter, now, of this, you know, electrical power. It will reduce our consumption of coal power, which, up to now, is a critical factor in our baseload generation, in Botswana.

So, I suppose my three minutes is up. I really wanted to just highlight those. And thank you very much for this opportunity.

MR. ORDU: Honorable Minister, thank you. Thank you very much. Let's now turn to Mr.

Jurgen Karl Zattler, please, of the German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development.

MR. ZATTLER: Yes, thanks a lot. Thanks for having me, and thanks for the very, very interesting work, to Fatima and her team. I think, generally, I can say that I support the work and the conclusions, in particular. So, these are the issues, and I would just, you know, to -- like to echo what Fatima has said, some important points. The first one is Africa is important because Africa is, perhaps not at the moment, but in the future, will be a major source of emissions.

So, Africa will develop. Africa will grow its population, and I think this is a factor we have to consider. But Africa, also, has role to play, at least a potential one, in the future new world, in terms of raw materials, in terms of cooperation, for example, regarding the production of hydrogen, in terms of the production of renewable energy because it's the continent which has the biggest potential in renewable energy, and also cheap one. So, this is a real economic factor.

And a second point I wanted to make, is -- and it's also echoing what Fatima has said.

Africa is very vulnerable to climate change. As she said, seven out of the 10 most vulnerable countries are in Africa. So, this is another very, very obvious interest by Africa, but also by Europe, to avoid that this potential crisis will happen. And there are two more factors, which are relevant in that context. It's -- the first one is the world is changing.

So, it's the new deal. It's Europe's Green Deal. It's what happening in the U.S. It's what just -- yesterday and the day before, the G7 decided. It's what will happen in China. So, the world is moving. In particular, the private business is moving. Private investors go out of fossil fuel intensive industries, and this can precipitate, it can go very quickly. And I think Africa and others have to make up their mind, do they want to stay in the old world, or take the risk? And I would say, of course, it's a risk, always, when you change your positions.

Do you want to take the risk to go for this new world? And we can't take that decision for Africa, and Africa is not homogeneous. Every African Country has to take that decision. What we can do is to offer support, and to offer cooperation, and I think Europe should not pretend that we don't have interests. Of course, we have interests, and I think, that's part of a real partnership. Like under adults, you know, everyone has to spell out his or her interests, and then you have to talk and to find a compromise.

And, therefore, I think we -- what we -- what I would like to see is that we have such a deep dialogue, based on real facts, and the facts are partly there, but not all of the facts. For example, we know that renewables is, in most countries, the least cost intensive option, but there are many things we don't know. It's a little bit the problem that we cannot foresee the future. But there are things we know, and, therefore, what Europe can also do is to work with African partners to get a better

understanding, and then build trust, and trust based on, you know, a real spelling out of interests, and

based on facts and analysis.

And there we can use, also, as Fatima said, the multilateral institutions, with their analytic capacity. I was Executive Director for Germany, in the World Bank, and I changed only end of last year. The World Bank has immense analytical capacity, so has the IMF. But, for example, what I was asking for, and which I only was half successful, is that the World Bank takes into account climate issues, in all its diagnostic work. For example, when we look at the analytical reports, economic prospects, climate is not really an issue, but there are huge risks, and climate investments can also foster economic growth. So, you really have to fully take that into account, and this can help African countries and us to better

But, of course, also, Germany is part of the European Union, and the European Union has a long tradition, as you said, in partnership with Africa. I think we should continue that, and we should try to revamp it, and perhaps also to look where things have to be enhanced. There will be the EU-AU Summit, this year, and this will be an opportunity to look at that, for example, to look at what is my favorite subject, to look at macro fiscal policies, to how macro fiscal policies can enhance climate action. And, of course, my ministry is heavy involved. I think, in 2019, we provided some one billion climate financing for African Countries. We will continue to do that and try even to intensify it to do that. Thanks a lot.

MR. ORDU: Thank you. Thank you very, very much. Let's now turn to our colleague from the AUC, Simplice Nouala.

MR. NYAMBE: Good Evening. I'm not Simplice Nouala, but I'm Harsen Nyambe.

MR. ORDU: Okay, go ahead.

understand what the challenges are and to best tackle those challenges.

MR. NYAMBE: And I'm actually acting Director for Sustainable Environment and Blue

Economy.

MR. ORDU: Okay, you're welcome.

MR. NYAMBE: (audio skip).

MR. ORDU: Okay, I believe we're having some challenges out -- Mr. Nyambe, we're

having problems hearing you.

MR. NYAMBE: Thank you for this opportunity, and basically (audio skip).

MR. ORDU: Mr. Nyambe, we're having some challenges hearing you. I'm going to turn

now to the --

MR. NYAMBE: (audio skip).

MR. ORDU: All right, I'm going to turn to our colleague from the African Development

Bank, Vanessa Ushie, and then we'll try and check out you, in a minute, AUC, Mr. Nyambie, later. Thank

you very much. Vanessa, over to you, thank you.

MS USHIE: Thank you so much, Aloysius. Thank you, to The Brookings Institution.

Thank you to Dr. Fatima Denton, and the team at the UN New Era, for inviting the AfDB. It's a pleasure to

be here, at this important and very timely conversation. So, I really enjoyed Fatima's presentation

because it lays the stakes on the table for Africa, and the question is, is the glass half empty or half full?

Because people think of going green as something that is really high risk. But perhaps there are some

opportunities for Africa. What comes out of the presentation is that the management of

natural resources will drive the green transition. And so, the policies, the strategies, the systems of

natural resource production and consumption will be critical to being transformed, to meeting that main

transition. I think, secondly, an important point is that Africa's approach should be homegrown. So, there

are discussions about the risk of stranded assets and resources, and the response to that, I think, we'll go

into that in the panel discussion. But just to reiterate that, of course, Africa has a right to development.

And so, the way in which it transforms, the use of fossil fuels and other resources will be driven by its

internal domestic needs.

As we know, about 600 million Africans are in need of energy. We also have a huge

infrastructure gap of around a \$100 billion U.S., a year, to be filled. So, these needs would have to be

met by using Africa's natural resources, in a way that responds to its internal development challenges.

Finally, I would like to emphasize that, in terms of multilateral financial institutions can do, the AfDB is already thinking along mainstreaming climate change and nature into its operation.

So, as Dr. Jurgen was speaking, I was very excited to see that, perhaps, all NDBs can take this approach. So, how do we design projects? How do we implement projects, our research, analysis, policy advice to countries? We have tools. We have metrics, which we have used to assess how climate change, nature, and biodiversity are being integrated.

A very good example is the Bank's COVID-19 Response Facility, of U.S. -- about U.S. -- \$10 billion U.S., which we've used to support African Countries, to beat the pandemic. And a very big component of that, is that nature-based solutions. So, the point is that we're already transforming, and we shouldn't think of this as a futuristic debate. The time is now, and I hope that, with conversation and others, we can support African Countries with a green transition. Thank you.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very much, Vanessa, especially for also keeping to -- for the time. Let's now turn to Jean-Paul Adam. Any reaction to the presentation, by Dr. Denton, please.

MR. ADAMS: Thank you so much, Chair, and, firstly, I bring greetings from Dr. Vera Songwei, of the United Nations Economic Commissions for Africa, and we would like to offer our wholehearted support for this report and congratulate Fatima, I think, on what is an excellent piece of work, and which really contributes towards building forward in Africa.

And a couple of things, which I think really resonate and which are the key messages, from our perspective. The first one, which Fatima outlined, is that we're all in this together, and that Europe cannot achieve its own Green Deal, unless there is engagement with Africa. And that is linked to the point that Africa's Green Deal, or Africa's Green Stimulus, must be homegrown and completely owned by the individual countries, in Africa.

There has to be a complete, I would say, and adoption of the principals of a green recovery, within National Development Plans. These need to be linked with nationally determined contributions, under the Paris Agreement, first to truly achieve a global result, in terms of climate resilience, and this is directly linked, as well, to the global result that we want to achieve, in responding to COVID-19. The likelihood, of course, that COVID-19 had some zoonotic origins, it means that building climate resilience, is something which, to use the cliché, I think, which has come about, is that no country

is safe, until all countries are safe.

And in the same way, unless we can hard wire climate resilience into your African

development, we are essentially seeing future risks, that will affect the whole world, and those risks may

be in the context of public health, but they will also be in terms of the economic risk of contagion because

the global economy is connected in a way that it has never been before.

Now -- and that means that the need for a green recovery cannot be divorced from the

need for the overall development priorities of African countries. And so, Net Zero is important for Africa

because it is essential for its resilience. And the toll of climate change is already very significant in Africa,

and this came out in the presentation, with some future impacts being up to 15 percent of GDP. And I

think that African countries are already spending 5 percent, at least 5 percent of GDP, responding, in

many cases to climate-related disasters.

But we must make sure that Net Zero is also embedded in the path to zero poverty and

zero hunger. And so, we must address these issues in the context of bridging the development gap, and,

very importantly, linking it to livelihoods. And I think we saw, in relation to jobs, from this report, that

particularly energy is perhaps the first platform. It is literally the energizer, which allows economies to

grow. And this is where Africa, in particular, is lagging behind and where we need that investment to take

place.

And the final point, I would say, is that we are concerned about the need for a just

transition, and Fatima mentioned that there is a need for a managed exit from, for example, a lot of the

fossil fuel-based industries, and even you can argue that a lot of the commodities-based exports, that

currently dominate the African economy are going to trap African countries, if we're not careful, into

unsustainable models of economic growth.

And -- but I would tend to look at it rather than an exit, rather a managed entry into a new

model of economic development, and in that context, I think the main issue that is required is addressing

the dramatic investment which it needs to be frontloaded. There is limited fiscal space in Africa. There's

a rising debt burden. And, unfortunately, there's also no significant additional climate or development

finance resources on the horizon.

There's some very good messages coming out of the G7, that has recently met, and we

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 1800 Diagonal Road, Suite 600 Alexandria, VA 22314

hope that this will lead to other things. But in terms of new financing, this is still very limited at present, apart from, of course, what's being announced for vaccines, which is very important. So, I think the just transition really starts with giving African countries the ability to invest themselves in the green recovery and green pathways. Thank you.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very much, Jean-Paul. I have a couple of questions for each of the panelists, and then we will turn around and see what our audience questions -- the questions posed by the audience. Let's start first with you, Jurgen. You mentioned that the number of, you know, the inexplicable link, you know, and ways that Africa-EU is really a very important collaboration, as we go forward. One of the things that came out of the presentation is that the EU argues for green transition, and we've heard it time and time again, as you've stated, as well. Dr. Denton mentioned that Africa's argument is for a just transition. Can you help us reconcile these two views, please?

MR. ZATTLER: You know, I did -- I don't know if I got the question you're asking me, what I'm thinking about, that, you know, that tension perhaps, that Europe is arguing for a green terms of transition. I think, also, internally, in Germany, for example, I could say, this issue of a just transition is very important, and we are facing general elections, and this is one of the most important things because it's clear that you can't do the green transition, if it's not just, because, then, parts of the population will not buy in, and perhaps the majority.

But we have some evidence that it can work, and, for example, you know, just to give you the most striking example, if you phase out fossil fuel subsidies, it's about 6 percent of global GDP, and you take that money and you give it to the poor, this will be very, very pro-poor, this compounded reform, phasing out fossil fuel subsidies and giving the money to the poor. So, there are ways to do it, and we have to identify those ways. And I think I asked my staff to focus on that issue. What is best practice, with regard to a green and also a just transition, for example, how to introduce carbon taxes, in a way which are really just? What do we know? You can do it in a very stupid way, and you can do it in an intelligent way. So, that's really the issue.

But I think your question has another dimension. It's not only just, internally, domestically. It's also just, with regard to both sides. And, of course, I think that's an issue, but, again, first, does Africa have the choice not to do it, not to go green? I think this will be a disaster. I'm

convinced others might have other opinions. But I am convinced that it will be a disaster for the economies, for the rich, for the poor. It's not sustainable, this path. And then, of course, the issue is if there are commodity exporters, for example, fossil fuel exporters. Of course, we should help those countries. We should help Nigeria to get rid of this. I mean, we can also say that commodity exporters --

the poor didn't have the big benefit from this growth model.

But, nevertheless, we need a plan to transition those economies, and there are some ideas around. Again, that's a lot about analytics and to get it right. For example, in the World Bank, we supported, or, for example, the World Resource Institute supported Indonesia to draw up a plan, how to decarbonize the economy, to the benefit of the country and the poor.

MR. ORDU: Thank you. Thank you very much. Let's turn to Vanessa. The view, I mean, the debt burden on the continent, now, has been further aggravated by the COVID-19, as we all know, and a number of remarks to that effect were made. And domestic resource mobilization is also a huge challenge, at this time, across the continent. So, with poverty and unemployment also worsened by the pandemic, is it realistic to ask South Africa to abandon its goal, and Nigeria and Angola to abandon their fossil fuel, right now?

MS. USHIE: Thank you for the question, Aloysius. I think, as we've said, today, from the presentation, and looking at the current reality, it's clear that the transition out of fossil fuels is going to be managed. It's actually a gradual process. And, first of all, I agree with Jurgen, there's a knowledge gap on the risk of stranded access, that has to be filled. We need to go to Nigeria, South Africa, and other countries, and say, these are the resource classes which are most exposed to stranding. This is what you have to do to minimize your exposure to these risks. These are strategies that other countries, developing countries, have adopted, which you could use.

And I think there are several ways of doing this. First of all, you look at accumulated resource rent, in resource rich countries. They could be used to finance green sectors and help to create jobs that will draw in the youth, which are unemployed. So, using existing natural resource rents to finance this green transition will be very critical. And, of course, there are several African countries that have Sovereign Gold Coins, which varies in this regard.

I think, also, some level of innovation is required. Adopting carbon efficiency measures,

given in the resource expansion industries and other industry, and we have seen an uptick of nature-based solutions in the private sector (inaudible). So, there could be new measures and regulations to help support this growth of nature-based solution. But I think it's critical for us to understand that Africa's path towards a green transition would be homegrown, as other speakers have said. But there's a role for finance to help these countries transition.

So, first of all, closing the knowledge gap. How much are you at risk? What sectors are at risk, and the level of risk exposure? And then how do we transform the economy? I think a very important point, which I've already heard things about diversification. We talked about building resilience, but in a commodity dependent economy, it's fairly intuitive to think that best way to lessen your exposure to this risk of volatility in commodity prices is by having a more balanced economy. And I think (inaudible) tying to the green narrative because it shows countries that it's very possible for you to have a green transition and a more balanced economy. And I think, as I said, resource rents will be very critical to being mobilized to help countries actually make the transition from the short term to the long term.

MR. ORDU: And, Jean-Paul, from your perspectives at UNECA, the same question, please?

MR. ADAM: Well, I think the first element is that the just transition, a green transition, has to be just to build on, I think, what speakers have already said, that there is a -- if it's not -- if there is no element of justice within it, then it will not work in the first place. It has to be grounded within the needs of people and within the real needs of people. I think that Africa has already embraced this idea of a green transition. And we are talking about a just transition, so that the rest of the world understands what this will mean because it has to be something which recognizes that Africa has the least access to energy, currently, the largest percentage, also, of people living in poverty.

So, therefore, the impacts, as well, of a transition need to be managed more carefully.

And I think if we look at it, as well, from the perspective of, if we are going down that route of a green transition, where are the resources going to come from? And they have to be homegrown resources. But we have to be extremely realistic about the amounts that can be mobilized. All countries in the world have had to mobilize some form of stimulus to deal with the COVID-19 pandemic, but the discrepancies are enormous. In the United Kingdom, the stimulus has been close to 15 percent of GDP. The combined

stimulus of the United States of various packages is elevated to up to 27 percent of GDP.

In most African countries, the response has actually been below 1 percent of GDP, and that's not because African countries don't want to. It's because they don't have the resources. Their fiscal deficit has been, on average, below minus 8 percent, during the pandemic. So, there's no resources, very little resources coming in from taxation and from revenue. The same time, debt costs are rising, and they don't have cheap access to the markets because most of the large stimulus packages in the OECD countries have been financed by a very cheap access to finance.

So, if we are going to create those multipliers by investing in a green transition, and we know those multipliers exist, if we use the example of South Africa. A case study done by the ECA showed that if you invest in green sectors, which would be particularly energy, sustainable transportation, and nature-based solutions, you would get 250 percent more jobs than if you were investing in fossil fuel intensive sectors, and you would create 420 percent more value addition, throughout the economy. So, the evidence for the more positive impact of -- in terms of jobs, in terms of value addition from green sectors is there. But you do need to deal with this because those jobs may not be created in the same areas, for example, that your coal mine is, currently. So, we need that.

We need to manage that transition very carefully. And the impact of not managing it carefully will be even more pronounced in Africa because of the extreme vulnerability of populations, and the final point I'll just make there is that there are huge opportunities, and I think we heard about nature-based solutions from the African Development Bank, and I think is something that can really make a very big difference. But we need to get those resources in. South African countries can do that themselves. They've announced their intention through the Green Stimulus Program. But we would need to be able to fund the urgency of investment in these sectors.

MR. ORDU: Thank you. Thank you very much, Jean-Paul. Let's turn to Honorable Minister Lefoko Moagi. From what you've heard, are stranded fossil fuel assets a threat to development in Botswana, in your view?

MINISTER MOAGI: Thank you very much, moderator. I do not believe they are a threat, per se. Yes, we currently are using the abundance of coal, over 212 billion tons, for our baseload generation of electrical power. This is where we are. This is what is powering the economy in this current

juncture. But we have shown our commitment, in terms of adopting the transition. In fact, most of our

electrical power generation, going forward, is mostly on renewable energies, you see. So, we wanted to

see technologies. We want to see innovation, in terms of getting faster, in terms of all these renewables,

so that we can also procure a baseload. Remember, we don't have hydropower in Botswana, and,

therefore, we don't have that opportunity to use it for baseload power, mulch, and soils, things like that.

So, this is where we are.

But whilst we are transitioning and are very much aligned with the recommendation

made, but this going green must not be an enemy of just transition.

MR. ORDU: We may have lost the Ambassador. All right, before --

MINISTER MOAGI: Can you still hear me?

MR. ORDU: Okay, sure, go ahead.

MINISTER MOAGI: I'm back.

MR. ORDU: Okay, welcome back, yeah.

MINISTER MOAGI: Yes, thank you. I just cut off there. And I was saying that as we

explore to these fossil fuels, for now, transitioning to green, we must also exploit them, in the most

environmentally and socially responsible manner, with all the good governance practices that we need to

do because we -- as we do the mines or any of those, we must have a social license to operate. We

cannot be harming people, harming the environment, and hoping that the future generations can excuse

us for that.

So, it is very clear that we very much embrace this going green, and it is shown by our

future plans that everything is now green, green, green. In fact, most of our mines are now turning into a

green technology. They are using a rooftop solars. They've got research, in terms of using hydrogen to

power their vehicles away from diesel. They already have solar plants being erected in their mines, so

that we can have what we call green diamonds or green copper. That is the way that we are going about

it, in Botswana. Thank you.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very much. And the audience are waiting with a number of

questions. Jean-Paul, I'm going to start with you, and then move to Jurgen, and then we'll continue in

that order. There is a question here from Raju Bhatt. He's a Policy Analyst at Global Mediation Team.

Recently, where -- no, no, this -- the question is from Mr. Opoko Radha (phonetic), from New York.

Considering the EU's stance that it will not be providing funding for natural gas, as a transition fuel, and

the challenges that will naturally come with that ban, how can Africa make an equitable transition to non-

fossil fuel? Jean-Paul?

MR. ADAM: Thank you very much, Aloysius, and I think that's -- it's a critical question.

The issue of natural gas is that it is a key part, at least from the work that ECA has done. There's a key

part of the transition that is needed in Africa. The particularity of Africa is that Africa does not have a --

the required base generation. Of course, this is a generalization because it's a hugely diverse continent.

But many countries, I mean, there are countries in Africa that have electricity access that is below 10

percent. And where access is achievable, it's done through personally owned generators, you know, mini

grids, and so on, which are all part of the solution.

But because of that very big gap, in terms of base generation, and, at the moment, the

largest energy source for Africa is hydro, and hydro is very good, but we've seen, as we saw in the

experience of Zimbabwe recently, when Lake Kariba was affected by drought, this had the direct impact

on their ability to generate electricity. So, hydro, on its own, is not sufficient for a base energy, and the

problem of intermittency of renewables in Africa is significant because of this lack of base generation.

And, yes, we hope that there will be improvements in battery technology, that will solve

this problem soon, but in the meantime, because of this huge issue, we need to explore what is the best

way to achieve a base generation in countries. And, again, this will be different from country to country.

So, some countries can afford, already, to say, we can invest in renewables as the main mode of energy,

and a number of countries, particularly in North Africa, doing so. But there are some countries that really

need to upscale in a very dramatic fashion, and the reality is what is the cleanest fuel that is available in

Africa? And that's gas, and it's available within Africa.

The question of investment, and we would argue that there is a way of pairing the

investments in gas with investments in renewables. And I think that there is hope for looking at where,

oh, where can we upscale additional investments in renewables? And this can be done by looking at

empowering gas as the means of creating that base generation.

The other aspect which should

not be forgotten in Africa is the need for clean cooking solutions. There are almost 800 million Africans

who currently do not have access to clean cooking solutions. And, again, renewables will be part of the

solution, but cooking is something which is harder to do through those frameworks, particularly in many

rural areas of Africa. And the reality is that the first transition usually comes through some form of LPG, a

form of clean cooking. And the -- if we're going to tackle this in a really holistic manner, we need to

address this question of base generation, and the most suitable solution that we have, for the moment, is

through natural gas, which can also pair extremely well with the upscaling in renewables that we want to

see.

MR. ORDU: Jurgen, any thoughts? Same question.

MR. ZATTLER: Yes, same question. Perhaps three points. The first one, I don't think

that there is a kind of clear-cut decision by the Europeans, under no circumstances, to accept, in a way,

gas, as a transition technology. I think that's not the position. That's my first point.

The second point is there's always the question of what should you promote with public

money? And, for example, when we do development cooperation, or when we sit at the Board of the

World Bank, of the African Development Bank, or so, so, then the question is, should we use this public

money and public support to promote an outgoing technology? So, that's a tough question. That's my

second point.

My third point is a little bit along the lines of what Jean-Paul said, it's country specific.

And I think back, when I was at the Board of the World Bank, for me, it was never a question, guess yes

or no. It was always a question, what is happening in the country? For example, if there is a gas project,

which is really a transition technology in that context, and I can see in the energy composition that gas will

not stay, keep that importance, in the longer term, but renewables will come up. Then, perhaps it's more

acceptable than if you look at a country, where, you know, you establish gas technology and renewable

goes down. So, if we support gas, then renewables should be the mid-term, really, way to go. So,

renewables should go up. And that's the question to -- one has to look, country by country, at the

transition plan.

But gas is a -- I think, from my individual point of view, gas is a problem because it locks

in a technology for 30 years, which shouldn't exist any longer in 30 years. And that's the general

problem. And also renewables creates jobs. It's getting cheaper and cheaper. So, I think there is a high

bar investing, nowadays, in gas and even a higher investing exploration.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very much. I think it'd be good to -- I will revert to the audience questions again, shortly, before we finish, but I wanted to return to Vanessa, at this time, because the ADB, as we all know, has embarked on probably one of the most fascinating innovations coming out of the Bank, this notion of desert to power. As we all know, you know, the Sahara Desert, right, it's the world's largest solar farm, and the ADB's Desert to Power Project, I understand, will produce about 250 million people -- provide 250 million people with solar energy in the Sahel, by the year 2030, which, clearly, if we were to achieve this, will be fascinating and the way to go on the continent. Could you share with us any emerging lessons from that fascinating project? And what are the prospects for similar projects, going forward, in the future? Thank you.

MS. USHIE: Thank you very much, Aloysius. So, as you've said, the Desert to Power Initiative is one of the key frameworks that the Bank has undertaken to address energy poverty. And the assumption, of course, is that Africa's energy gap must be addressed before we can have sustainable development. So, the project covers 11 Sahel countries, and, as you said, it's expected to connect about 250 million people to electricity, by 2030.

Yes, there are prospects of having similar large-scale projects in other parts of Africa, in North Africa and in Southern Africa, and especially where we have regions with deserts, ecosystems, and prospects for low-cost solar power generation. And this is in reflection of the Bank's approach that we need to be ambitious, we need to work at skill, we need to look at energy solutions which are capturing large populations, and the expectation that, as more of these are done, not only do we address the energy gap, but also the transaction costs of large-scale energy would be reduced.

So, this is all part of the Bank's approach towards having a diversified energy mix, beyond fossil fuel, looking at hydro, looking at solar. We also have some geothermal projects in Kenya, as well. And there's also some new solar investments, in countries like Senegal and Ghana. So, we're actually looking at solar power as being a key driver of the green transition and looking to see how we can replicate the experiences from the Desert to Power Initiative in other parts of Africa.

MR. ORDU: Thank you. Thank you very much. I was just wondering, Jurgen, I remember, many years, being a PhD student in Sussex, and I visited Konstanz, in Germany, and we

were debating this notion that the best collaboration between Africa and Europe will be for Europe to

finance, you know, solar power in the Sahara Desert, which is basically -- you know, you have -- this is

the largest, as we indicated, solar farm on Earth. And that argument has now receded. We don't hear

much. I just wondered what are your thoughts now, especially that the African Development Bank has

started doing these sort of solar energy projects in the Sahel, whether this part of what your own

government, and, indeed, as spokesman for the EU, what the EU thinks about this initiative?

MR. ZATTLER: Yes, it's good sitting at the -- Lake Constance and talking about these

kind of things. I think, you know, in a way, we can see that this happens, and I think we have to be aware

that this needs to happen by private investments. So, the private sector should invest into renewable

energy projects. And we can see that in many countries this happens because it's -- in many countries,

it's least cost. But it doesn't happen to the extent necessary, and, there, I think the public sector can help.

And one important issue is the policy frameworks. As long as you have high fossil fuel subsidies, it's

sometimes not so easy for the private sector to invest. That's one thing.

Then, you have the question of the baseload and the integration of the renewable plants,

into the system, into the grid, and, there, it's also something the public sector has to look at. And then

you have the question of technology. Still, we have problems with the storage technology, so the battery

technology. Can this be better solved? And there are the costs. It's solved, in a way, but it's still high

cost. The costs go down, but they have to go down more quickly. So, these are the issues we have to

look at, jointly.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very, very much. I'll now turn to a very, very important subject

that has been raised by Leslee Goldstein. Leslee Goldstein is the Director of Programming for Uganda at

The Rona and Jeffrey Abramson Foundation, an Adjunct Professor and Research Scholar at Maharishi

International University. And Dr. Goldstein's question, I would like a one-minute take from each of our

panelists. She asks, you know, can we talk more about how women can be brought in frontally, in the

fight against climate change in Africa? Let me start with you, Jean-Paul. The gender dimension of

climate change.

MR. ADAM: Sorry, it just took me a moment to unmute. The -- first of all, I think that

women are disproportionately impacted, of course, in sectors that are affected. We all know the

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 1800 Diagonal Road, Suite 600 Alexandria, VA 22314

important role that women play in agriculture, for example, which is the biggest source of employment.

And, unfortunately, this employment is too often informal, and any disruption which is caused by a natural disaster, whether it be flooding, whether it be drought, leads to massive impacts, in terms of incomes, and, consequently, on the social impacts within the country, more widely.

The -- I would look at it also from the perspective of the opportunity, again, investing in sectors which are green. It provides more opportunity for inclusion, and I think there's a very interesting statistic from the International Renewable Energy Agency, which shows that, among new jobs that are created in renewables, there are over 10 percent more created that are taken up by women, as opposed to jobs in fossil fuels. So, as the -- you know, I think it's 32 percent of new jobs in renewables are taken up by women, as opposed to 22 percent in fossil fuels. So, there's a real opportunity there to create jobs, which are widely available in the economy, which build opportunities within the value chain, and which are more inclusive.

This is also mirrored in investments and the -- well, investments in nature-based solutions. The work that we have done at the ECA has shown that nature-based solutions are particularly effective, in terms of generating employment quickly when responding, for example, to the pandemic. Nature-based solutions can also provide jobs at different levels. You can have low-skilled, easy entry jobs, which are important when you have large populations that, perhaps, do not have access to appropriate skills and capacity building. But there are also opportunities to upscale the earning potential of those jobs in the longer term. So, you can start, quite often, with the sort of things like agroforestry, but it can develop in the future to, for example, around ecotourism, which creates more -- a higher value and, again, more inclusion, particularly around gender.

So, I think the question of a just transition is also about addressing the inequity that exists in terms of gender, and I would argue, as well, in terms of including young people in the workforce, as well, which is a huge issue. In Africa, a lot of the jobs that are created are not bringing young people into the workforce, and at least not in a formal way, and I think investing in renewables, nature-based solutions are key strategies to solve that.

MR. ORDU: Honorable Minister, any thoughts on the same question, the role of gender, the inclusion in the fight against planet change in Botswana?

MINISTER MOAGI: Yes, thank you, Aloysius. I believe that we, nowadays, always talk

about inclusion, whether it's inclusion of women, inclusion of young people, inclusion of people with

disabilities. This is where we are going. In the media, today, population splits, really. We are looking at

about 60-40, in most cases, in most countries, sometimes even more, straight towards women. We also

see, nowadays, at high school, university, and colleges, a lot of women embracing STEM, you know, the

science, and engineering, and technology, the mathematics subjects. We see that most are embracing a

lot of agrotourism, ecotourism. So, we believe that the time is now.

In Africa, or in Botswana, in particular, we have a saying that mossadi tariyasa chava,

essentially is the woman the builder of the nation, you know? So, we believe that if they are entrusted

with these issues, they will actually now bring about those innovations, whether it's solar farms, wind

farms, any other of the renewable energies, bringing in a lot more of the younger people, who can then

continue the sustenance of those projects. So, we believe that women always play a critical role, as well,

in terms of not just being there on the jobs and doing them but making sure there is sustainability. They

always think more at home, or think about what happens to my children, rather than just thinking about

yourself there, as the man. So, yes, looking at the population dynamics, I believe that it is more secure

towards women, more secure towards young people. There's a good chance that -- and a good

argument for them to be included in the forefront of these renewable energies for climate change and

including the economy. Thank you.

MR. ORDU: Thank you, Honorable Minister. I would like to turn to Jurgen, briefly, very

quickly, on this same subject, and then since our panelists include both Vanessa and Fatima, I would like

their thoughts, too, one minute each, on the role of women in this fight because they are at the forefront,

the receiving end of many of the climate change challenges, as we know, on our continent, but, briefly,

first, Jurgen.

MR. ZATTLER: Yeah. It's a complex issue, but I think, generally, perhaps one could say

that, in many cases, women care more about the longer term and the resilience and avoid crisis (audio

skip), and, therefore, perhaps women are more open to this kind of new technology.

MR. ORDU: Yeah.

MR. ZATTLER: And then, as has been said, perhaps green jobs are more for women

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 1800 Diagonal Road, Suite 600 Alexandria, VA 22314

because the old fossil fuel jobs, for example, the coal industry, but many others in manufacturing, are more typical male jobs. So, perhaps male will lose, and I think this opens up a possibility for women. Perhaps we also have to think about what to do with the male now, that we should also avoid that problem. But I think this opens up possibilities, for example, nature-based solutions, and it's very much soft skills you need in that area. Thank you.

MR. ORDU: Thank you. Thank you very much. Vanessa?

MS. USHIE: Thank you, Aloysius. I would approach the issue on three grounds. First of all is on women's agency. Are women visible in the debate on climate change? Are women at the negotiating table on the climate change issue? It is our job, as development institutions and power women, to be more visible, to be more engaged and aware of the issues relating to the impact of climate change on their lives, on their livelihoods, and their communities, their societies, and their countries.

So, the first step is really to empower women, to give them a voice, to elevate their voice, and there are many ways that the AfDB and other actors are doing this, as part of some of the UN processes on climate change and biodiversity. The second approach is looking at the policies and framework. So, we've seen, as you've said, and others have said, today, that women are the forefront of finding solutions in climate change. A very good example is looking at community-based natural resource management, how women are involved in managing forest, watershed, and natural assets that can help address some of the challenges that we see on climate change in Africa.

So, I think if we look at, first of all, the agency of women, how this can be transformed, secondly, the policies and strategies. We need to retool our thinking, and some of that is already happening, for instance with the AfDB. We are developing a new climate change strategy, and the heart of that is of women's empowerment, women's engagement. The specific initiatives in which we can engage women more effectively, at the community level, to begin to mainstream climate change into the activity and drawing on that, as a macro skill, as a more effective way of fighting climate change.

Finally, it's on investments. So, if we have adaptation finance, is it really going to women's activities? And the idea of women benefitting more from green jobs is very feasible and attractive, and it's something that we could explore, certainly, going forward. So, I think if you look at these three dimensions, you can have a more holistic view of how women can be more engaged in the

process of fighting climate change in Africa. Thank you.

MR. ORDU: Thank you very much, Vanessa. Fatima, last word on this, and then we can wrap up. Any thoughts on the gender dimension of the wonderful work you presented us today?

MS. DENTON: Okay, thanks a lot, Aloysius. Ritualistically, I always tend to say that women are the single largest untapped potential that we have in Africa. They have to seize to become a potential. I think Jean-Paul mentioned the informal sector. Many women are in the informal sector. So, I think we can use them to test drive some of these green solutions, you know? I think they have an important role in test driving. They can be a Litmus test, actually, of great solutions. You know, what are some of -- when you walk through the streets of Ghana, you see women in, you know, street vendors and doing quite a lot of things that requires energy. You know, so, how do we improve, you know, in terms of energy efficiency? How do we improve that, so that they can be extended into that sort of solution? So, that's one.

Secondly, in terms of climate change, I would say information is very important in managing climate change. Vanessa talked about adaptation. We haven't said much about adaptation. Adaptation is a key priority for Africa. We can't keep our eyes peeled only on mitigation. Both are important. But this is a continent that has huge investment to make in adaptation. So, women, again, have a key role because they are -- they form the backbone of the agricultural sector. So, I would say the way in which we support that, so the climate information services, and, you know, Jean-Paul and the ACPC have been doing quite a lot of work on the quality of information that can support female, you know, farmers and women farmers. So, I think that is another area where the women can come on board.

But I would say, what Jurgen said about the subsidies, let's give those subsidies, let's create opportunities around subsidies that are focused or channeled into hydrocarbon resources because the continent hasn't benefitted from hydrocarbon wealth. We have a lot of problems around illicit financial flows. And, again, ECA has done quite a lot of, you know, wonderful work on this. So, some of those opportunities need to be extracted in a way that would support, you know, women entrepreneurial opportunities. So, those are the three areas that I would say we need to support women, information, in digitalization, but also in terms of green energy solutions, especially those that are relevant to the informal

sector.

MR. ORDU: Thank you. Thank you very, very much. I'm conscious that we had our

colleague from the African Union Commission, Harsen Nyambe, and I'm sorry to learn that due to

connectivity issues, he has clearly not been able to join us. For those of you watching out for him, we've

been trying, all the time, to see if we can reconnect with him. But on that note, I wanted to basically bring

this conversation to a close, and it's very, very difficult to sum up everything that we heard today.

First of all, it's important that, as Vanessa and many of the speakers outlined, clearly, the

challenges on the continent are enormous. Some might argue that most of the challenges of climate

were not necessarily, in terms of, you know, the greenhouse gases, Africa, its contribution to greenhouse

gas is very, very small. But the point is this is one world, and so, we remain vulnerable to it.

Second is we really, as Vanessa rightly mentioned, we didn't focus too much on

adaptation. I'm hoping that, you know, opportunities in the future will do so. Thirdly, EU-Africa. EU-

Africa, we are in this together, right? And this is very important. And the time is gone when we debate

these issues. We're in this together, and, therefore, as we transition to -- as we move from -- to a just

transition, I think this kind of solidarity and collaboration between the EU and Africa, and, indeed, between

Africa on other -- as partners, elsewhere, will be very, very important.

The impact, we hear from our panelists, the impact of the transition has to be managed

carefully. Very, very important that we ensure the recognition for the vital role of women, as we've heard

from all our panelists in that fight. On that note, I would particularly like to thank Fatima Denton and her

colleagues, at the UN Investor Institute, for partnering with us to have this conversation on what is,

indeed, a very important week on the African calendar, the African Climate Week. You know, my special

thanks to the Honorable Minister from Botswana, you know, Lefoko Moagi, for making the time to be with

us today. Thanks to Jean-Paul Adam for joining us. Vanessa, of course, from the African Development

Bank, thank you for joining us, and Jurgen, from the German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation

and Development. Thank you very, very much to all of you for joining us. And we look forward to

continued collaboration with all of you, and this session is considered closed. Thank you.

MS. DENTON: Thank you.

MINISTER MOAGI: Thank you, all.

* * * * *

CERTIFICATE OF NOTARY PUBLIC

I, Carleton J. Anderson, III do hereby certify that the forgoing electronic file when

originally transmitted was reduced to text at my direction; that said transcript is a true record of the

proceedings therein referenced; that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the

parties to the action in which these proceedings were taken; and, furthermore, that I am neither a relative

or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor financially or otherwise

interested in the outcome of this action.

Carleton J. Anderson, III

(Signature and Seal on File)

Notary Public in and for the Commonwealth of Virginia

Commission No. 351998

Expires: November 30, 2024