



APPENDIX TO  
CONSIDERING COLLUSION: A PRIMER ON POTENTIAL  
CRIMES

OCTOBER 31, 2018

BARRY H. BERKE, DANI R. JAMES, NOAH BOOKBINDER, AND  
NORMAN L. EISEN\*

*This document lists in chronological order the key known facts relating to the Russia investigation that are potentially relevant to the collusion crimes discussed in our paper.*

*The items in this chronology are drawn from public sources, including legal filings, newspaper articles, congressional testimony, social media posts, and interview transcripts that were available at the date of publication.*

**Abbreviated chronology of key facts**

**2014:** According to a federal indictment filed on February 16, 2018, beginning as early as 2014, Internet Research Agency LLC conducts operations to interfere with the U.S. political system, including the 2016 presidential election. These efforts are financed by Yevgeniy Viktorovich Prigozhin and companies he controls, including Concord Management and Consulting LLC and Concord Catering. 13 individuals allegedly worked at Internet Research Agency to carry out its interference operations.<sup>1</sup>

**“In or around” 2015:** Internet Research Agency and its agents begin to purchase social media advertisements as part of their efforts to influence American politics.<sup>2</sup>

**June 16, 2015:** Donald J. Trump announces his candidacy for president.<sup>3</sup>

**Early-to-Mid 2016:** According to court filings, Internet Research Agency LLC develops “a strategic goal to sow discord in the U.S. political system, including the 2016 U.S. presidential

<sup>1</sup> Indictment, U.S. v. Internet Research Agency, No. 18-cr-32 (D.D.C. Feb. 16, 2018) (henceforth “Russian Interference Indictment”) at ¶¶ 1-3, <https://www.justice.gov/file/1035477/download>.

<sup>2</sup> *Id.* at ¶ 35.

<sup>3</sup> Jose A. Del Real, Donald Trump Announces Presidential Bid, *Washington Post*, Jun. 16, 2015, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/post-politics/wp/2015/06/16/donald-trump-toannounce-his-presidential-plans-today/?utm\\_term=.094ea71896f7](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/post-politics/wp/2015/06/16/donald-trump-toannounce-his-presidential-plans-today/?utm_term=.094ea71896f7).

election” and “by early to mid-2016, [the agency and its employees’] operations include[] supporting the presidential campaign of then-candidate Donald J. Trump . . . and disparaging Hillary Clinton.”<sup>4</sup>

**February 10, 2016:** Internet Research Agency’s efforts to interfere in the election develop as an outline of themes for content is circulated internally. Individuals operating fake social media accounts are instructed “to post content that focused on ‘politics in the USA’ and to ‘use any opportunity to criticize Hillary and the rest (except Sanders and Trump—we support them).”<sup>5</sup>

**March 2016:** According to a federal indictment obtained July 13, 2018, starting in at least March 2016, Russian military officers working for the Main Intelligence Directorate of the General Staff (GRU) begin hacking the email accounts of volunteers and employees of the campaign of eventual Democratic candidate for president, Hillary Clinton as well as the computer networks of the Democratic National Committee and the Democratic Congressional Campaign Committee.<sup>6</sup>

**March 14, 2016:** While traveling in Italy, Trump advisor George Papadopoulos meets with Joseph Mifsud, a professor with ties to the Russian government. The professor takes great interest in Papadopoulos after Papadopoulos tells him that he has joined the Trump campaign.<sup>7</sup>

**March 19, 2016:** Russian military officers send a spearphishing email to Hillary Clinton’s campaign chairman, John Podesta, that included instructions to change his password by clicking a link that took him to website created by the Russian officers purporting to allow him to change his Google password. Podesta followed the instructions, and the information he provided gave Russian officers access to his email account. Russian military officers continue using spearphishing attacks on individuals associated with the Clinton campaign into the summer of 2016.

Later in March, Russian military officers download the contents of Podesta’s email account, including over 50,000 emails.<sup>8</sup>

**March 24, 2016:** At a meeting in London, Mifsud introduces Papadopoulos to a woman named Olga Polonskaya (note that some news reports have referred to her by her maiden name, Olga Vinogradova).<sup>9</sup> Mifsud claims that Polonskaya is a “relative of Russian President Vladimir Putin

---

<sup>4</sup> Russian Interference Indictment at ¶ 6.

<sup>5</sup> *Id.* at ¶ 43a.

<sup>6</sup> Indictment at ¶¶ 1-2, U.S. v. Netyksho, No. 18-cr-215 (D.D.C. Jul. 13, 2018) (henceforth “Netyksho Indictment”), <https://www.justice.gov/file/1080281/download>.

<sup>7</sup> Statement of the Offense, U.S. v. Papadopoulos, 17-cr-182 (Oct. 5, 2017), <https://www.justice.gov/file/1007346/download> (henceforth “Papadopoulos Stmt.”); Karla Adam, Jonathan Krohn and Griff Witte, Professor at Center of Russia Disclosures Claimed to Have Met with Putin, *Washington Post*, Oct. 31, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/professor-named-in-russia-disclosures-says-he-has-cleanconscious/2017/10/31/41a7a08e-be3b-11e7-959cfe2b598d8c00\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.eba58abbd06d](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/professor-named-in-russia-disclosures-says-he-has-cleanconscious/2017/10/31/41a7a08e-be3b-11e7-959cfe2b598d8c00_story.html?utm_term=.eba58abbd06d).

<sup>8</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶¶ 21-22.

<sup>9</sup> Sharon LaFraniere, David D. Kirkpatrick, Andrew Higgins and Michael Shwartz, A London Meeting of an Unlikely Group: How a Trump Adviser Came to Learn of Clinton ‘Dirt’, *New York Times*, Nov. 10, 2017, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/11/10/us/russia-inquiry-trump.html>.

with connections to senior Russian government officials.”<sup>10</sup> (Papadopoulos initially described Polonskaya to others in the campaign as “Putin’s niece;” however, he later learned that she was in fact unrelated to the Russian President.<sup>11</sup>) Afterward, Papadopoulos informs Sam Clovis, his “campaign supervisor” and Trump’s national campaign co-chair,<sup>12</sup> and several other members of the Campaign’s foreign policy team about the meeting and explained that he, Mifsud, and Polonskaya had discussed arranging “a meeting between us and the Russian leadership to discuss U.S.-Russia ties under President Trump.” In response, Clovis writes that he would “work it through the campaign,” but that no commitments should be made. Clovis also adds, “Great work.”<sup>13</sup>

**March 28, 2016:** Paul Manafort joins the Trump campaign to manage the campaign’s delegate process and the Republican nominating convention. He is eventually promoted to campaign chairman and chief strategist on May 19, 2016.<sup>14</sup>

**Early April 2016:** George Papadopoulos sends multiple emails to the Trump campaign’s foreign policy team to update them about ongoing discussions with Mifsud and Polonskaya and his “outreach to Russia.”<sup>15</sup>

**April 6, 2016:** Russian military officers create an email account designed to appear to be that of a member of the Clinton Campaign and use it to send spearphishing emails to over 30 Clinton campaign employees. The spearphishing emails included a link purporting to direct recipients to a polling document that was actually a website created by the Russian military officers.<sup>16</sup>

**April 11, 2016:** Paul Manafort exchanges emails with his longtime business associate Konstantin Kilimnik. Manafort writes, “I assume you have shown our friends my media coverage, right?” Kilimnik responds, “Absolutely. Every article.” Manafort responds, “How do we use to get whole. Has OVD operation seen?”<sup>17</sup> (*The Atlantic* and *The Washington Post* have identified Russian oligarch Oleg Vladimirovich Deripaska as the individual referred to as OVD in Manafort’s emails.<sup>18</sup> In 2006, Deripaska invested \$18.9 million into Manafort’s proposed

---

<sup>10</sup> Papadopoulos Stmt. at ¶ 7.

<sup>11</sup> Ali Watkins, *Mysterious Putin ‘Niece’ Has a Name*, *Politico*, Nov. 9, 2017, <https://www.politico.com/story/2017/11/09/putin-niece-olga-vinogradova-george-papadopoulos-russiaprobe-244758> (this article refers to Polonskaya by her maiden name, Vinogradova).

<sup>12</sup> Rosalind S. Helderman, *Who’s Who in the George Papadopoulos Court Documents*, *Washington Post*, Nov. 2, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/whos-who-in-the-georgepapadopoulos-court-documents/2017/10/30/e131158c-bdb3-11e7-97d9-bdab5a0ab381\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.8bae65f9db63](https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/whos-who-in-the-georgepapadopoulos-court-documents/2017/10/30/e131158c-bdb3-11e7-97d9-bdab5a0ab381_story.html?utm_term=.8bae65f9db63).

<sup>13</sup> Papadopoulos Stmt. at ¶ 8.

<sup>14</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 21b.

<sup>15</sup> Papadopoulos Stmt. at ¶ 10a.

<sup>16</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 21d.

<sup>17</sup> Julia Ioffe and Franklin Foer, *Did Manafort Use Trump to Curry Favor With a Putin Ally?*, *The Atlantic*, Oct. 2, 2017, <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/10/emails-suggestmanafort-sought-approval-from-putin-ally-deripaska/541677/>.

<sup>18</sup> *Id.*; Tom Hamburger, Rosalind S. Helderman, Carol D. Leonnig and Adam Entous, *Manafort Offered to Give Russian Billionaire ‘Private Briefings’ on 2016 Campaign*, *Washington Post*, Sept. 20, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/manafort-offered-to-give-russian-billionaire-private-briefings-on-2016-campaign/2017/09/20/399bba1a-9d48-11e7-8ea1-ed975285475e\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.e90c1d14eab3](https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/manafort-offered-to-give-russian-billionaire-private-briefings-on-2016-campaign/2017/09/20/399bba1a-9d48-11e7-8ea1-ed975285475e_story.html?utm_term=.e90c1d14eab3).

investment fund; the money went missing, and in 2011, Manafort stopped replying to Deripaska's efforts to reach him.<sup>19)</sup>

**April 26, 2016:** At a breakfast meeting at a London hotel, Mifsud informs Papadopoulos that he met with high-level Russian government officials during a recent trip to Russia. Papadopoulos later admits that Mifsud revealed to him that Mifsud had learned that the Russians had obtained "dirt" on then-candidate Hillary Clinton. Papadopoulos later tells the F.B.I. that Mifsud informed him that "the Russians had emails of Clinton" and that "they have thousands of emails."<sup>20</sup>

**April 27, 2016:** Papadopoulos emails a "senior policy advisor" at the Trump campaign, "Have some interesting messages coming in from Moscow about a trip when the time is right."<sup>21</sup> Papadopoulos has admitted that on the same day, he also emails a high-ranking campaign official (identified by *The Washington Post* as Campaign Manager Corey Lewandowski) "to discuss Russia's interest in hosting Mr. Trump. Have been receiving a lot of calls over the last month about Putin wanting to host him and the team when the time is right."<sup>22</sup>

**May 2016:** Paul Erickson sends an email to Trump campaign advisor Rick Dearborn with the subject "Kremlin Connection." In the email, Erickson explains that he has close ties to the National Rifle Association (NRA) and Russia and offers to set up a "back-channel meeting" between candidate Trump and President Putin.<sup>23</sup>

Sometime in May, during a night of heavy drinking at Kensington Wine Rooms in London, Papadopoulos reveals to Alexander Downer, Australia's top diplomat in Britain, that Russia has political dirt on Hillary Clinton.<sup>24</sup>

Also in May, the DNC and DCCC become aware that hackers have infiltrated their computer networks and hire a security company to identify the extent of the intrusion.<sup>25</sup>

**Late May 2016:** Roger Stone, a one-time business partner of Paul Manafort and a consultant of Donald Trump who briefly served on the Trump campaign, meets with a man calling himself Henry Greenberg, who reportedly "offered damaging information about Hillary Clinton" for \$2 million.<sup>26</sup> Stone was later texted by Trump campaign communications official Michael Caputo,

---

<sup>19</sup> Franklin Foer, [The Astonishing Tale of the Man Mueller Just Indicted](https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/06/the-astonishing-tale-of-the-man-muellercalls-person-a/562217/), *The Atlantic*, Jun. 6, 2018, <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/06/the-astonishing-tale-of-the-man-muellercalls-person-a/562217/>.

<sup>20</sup> Papadopoulos Stmt. at ¶ 14.

<sup>21</sup> *Id.* at ¶ 15.

<sup>22</sup> Papadopoulos Stmt. at ¶ 15b.

<sup>23</sup> Nicholas Fandos, [Operative Offered Trump Campaign 'Kremlin Connection' Using N.R.A. Ties](https://www.nytimes.com/2017/12/03/us/politics/trump-putinrussia-nra-campaign.html), *New York Times*, Dec. 3, 2017, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/12/03/us/politics/trump-putinrussia-nra-campaign.html>.

<sup>24</sup> Sharon LaFraniere, Mark Mazzetti and Matt Apuzzo, [How the Russia Inquiry Began: A Campaign Aide, Drinks and Talk of Political Dirt](https://www.nytimes.com/2017/12/30/us/politics/how-fbi-russia-investigation-began-georgepapadopoulos.html), *New York Times*, Dec. 30, 2017, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/12/30/us/politics/how-fbi-russia-investigation-began-georgepapadopoulos.html>.

<sup>25</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 32.

<sup>26</sup> Tom McCarthy, [Paul Manafort: How Decades of Serving Dictators Led to Role as Trump's Go-to Guy](https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2017/oct/30/paul-manafortprofile-donald), *Guardian*, Oct. 30, 2017, <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2017/oct/30/paul-manafortprofile-donald>.

who had arranged the meeting. Caputo asked, “[h]ow crazy is the Russian?” Stone replied, “[W]aste of time.” Caputo and Stone later claim that Greenberg is an FBI plant.<sup>27</sup>

**May 21, 2016:** Papadopoulos emails another high-ranking campaign official (identified by *The Washington Post* as Paul Manafort<sup>28</sup>) to inform him that “Russia has been eager to meet Mr. Trump for quite sometime and have been reaching out to me to discuss.”<sup>29</sup> Manafort reportedly forwards the email to Rick Gates and writes, “We need someone to communicate that [Trump] is not doing these trips.” Manafort continues, “It should be someone low level in the campaign so as not to send any signal.”<sup>30</sup>

**June 3, 2016:** Rob Goldstone, a British publicist who worked with the Miss Universe pageant in 2013 when Trump was an owner, writes to Donald Trump Jr., “The Crown prosecutor of Russia met with [Emin’s] father Aras this morning and in their meeting offered to provide the Trump campaign with some official documents and information that would incriminate Hillary and her dealings with Russia and would be very useful to your father. This is obviously very high level and sensitive information but is part of Russia and its government’s support for Mr. Trump – helped along by Aras and Emin.” Trump Jr. replied 17 minutes later in response, “Thanks Rob I appreciate that. I am on the road at the moment but perhaps I just speak to Emin first. Seems we have some time and if it’s what you say I love it especially later in the summer. Could we do a call first thing next week when I am back?”<sup>31</sup>

That same day, financial transactions begin to move \$3.3 million between Aras Agalarov and Irakly Kaveladze, a longtime Agalarov employee who would ultimately attend the meeting that arose from Goldstone’s outreach to Trump Jr.<sup>32</sup> Additional transactions involving Agalarov that bank examiners deemed suspicious occurred shortly after the meeting and again shortly after Trump’s election, before Kaveladze again sought a meeting on these issues with Trump associates.<sup>33</sup>

---

trump-dictators; Robert Costa, [Trump Ends Relationship With Longtime Political Adviser Roger Stone](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/postpolitics/wp/2015/08/08/trump-ends-relationship-with-longtime-political-adviser-roger-stone/), *Washington Post*, Aug. 8, 2015, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/postpolitics/wp/2015/08/08/trump-ends-relationship-with-longtime-political-adviser-roger-stone/>.

<sup>27</sup> Manuel Roig-Franzia and Rosalind S. Helderan, [Trump Associate Roger Stone Reveals New Contact With Russian National During 2016 Campaign](https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/trump-associate-roger-stone-reveals-new-contact-with-russiannational-during-2016-campaign/2018/06/17/4a8123c8-6fd0-11e8-bd50-b80389a4e569_story.html), *Washington Post*, Jun. 17, 2018, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/trump-associate-roger-stone-reveals-new-contact-with-russiannational-during-2016-campaign/2018/06/17/4a8123c8-6fd0-11e8-bd50-b80389a4e569\\_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/trump-associate-roger-stone-reveals-new-contact-with-russiannational-during-2016-campaign/2018/06/17/4a8123c8-6fd0-11e8-bd50-b80389a4e569_story.html).

<sup>28</sup> Helderan, *Washington Post*, Nov. 2, 2017.

<sup>29</sup> Papadopoulos Stmt. at ¶ 19.

<sup>30</sup> Hamburger, Leonnig and Helderan, *Washington Post*, Aug. 14, 2017; Bump, *Washington Post*, Oct. 30, 2017.

<sup>31</sup> Original photos of this email exchange were published by Donald Trump Jr. on his twitter account. See <https://twitter.com/donaldjtrumpjr/status/884789418455953413>; <https://twitter.com/DonaldJTrumpJr/status/884789839522140166>.

<sup>32</sup> Anthony Cormier and Jason Leopold, [The Planners Of The Trump Tower Meeting Moved Millions, And Mueller Is Now Investigating](https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/anthonymormier/mueller-investigation-money-trump-tower-meeting), *BuzzFeed News*, Sept. 21, 2018, <https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/anthonymormier/mueller-investigation-money-trump-tower-meeting>.

<sup>33</sup> Anthony Cormier and Jason Leopold, [A Series Of Suspicious Money Transfers Followed The Trump Tower Meeting](https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/anthonymormier/trump-tower-meeting-suspicious-transactions-agalarov), *BuzzFeed News*, Sept. 12, 2018, <https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/anthonymormier/trump-tower-meeting-suspicious-transactions-agalarov>.



**June 6, 2016:** Goldstone replies to Trump Jr.'s email in order to schedule a phone call between Trump Jr. and Emin Agalarov.<sup>34</sup> Twenty-one minutes after Goldstone's reply, Trump Jr. receives a call from a phone number that he later tells the House Intelligence Committee was Agalarov's. Later that day, a second call occurs between Trump Jr. and Agalarov. Phone records show that between the two calls, Trump Jr. receives a call from a "blocked" number. (As the House Intelligence Committee's Democratic minority later notes in a March 22, 2018 report, Corey Lewandowski told the Committee in an interview that President Trump's "primary residence has a blocked [phone] line.")<sup>35</sup>

**June 7, 2016:** Donald Trump wins the final Republican primaries and gives a victory speech at the Trump National Golf Club in Westchester, New York. During this speech he announces his plan to give a second speech, promising that "I am going to give a major speech on probably Monday of next week and we're going to be discussing all of the things that have taken place with the Clintons. I think you're going to find it very informative and very, very interesting."<sup>36</sup> The planned speech never takes place.

**June 9, 2016:** Donald Trump Jr., Paul Manafort, and Jared Kushner take the meeting arranged by Trump Jr. and Goldstone with Russian lawyer Natalia Veselnitskaya and Russian-American lobbyist Rinat Akhmetshin.<sup>37</sup> According to *The New York Times*, Veselnitskaya is a "trusted insider" in the Moscow legal community who "could be counted on to argue and win important high-profile court cases that matter to the government."<sup>38</sup> Previously, Veselnitskaya had worked "hand in glove with Russia's chief legal office to thwart a Justice Department civil fraud case against a well-connected Russian firm."<sup>39</sup> *The New York Times* has also reported that Akhmetshin has deep ties to the Russian government, including "an association with a former deputy head of a Russian spy service, the F.S.B., and a history of working for close allies of President Vladimir V. Putin."<sup>40</sup>

---

<sup>34</sup> *Id.*

<sup>35</sup> Minority Views re: Report on Russian Active Measures, Mar. 22, 2018, *House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence Minority*, [https://www.justsecurity.org/wpcontent/uploads/2018/04/House\\_minority.pdf](https://www.justsecurity.org/wpcontent/uploads/2018/04/House_minority.pdf) at 26.

<sup>36</sup> Ryan Teague Beckwith, Read Donald Trump's Subdued Victory Speech After Winning New Jersey, *Time*, Jun. 8, 2016, <http://time.com/4360872/donald-trump-new-jersey-victoryspeech-transcript/>.

<sup>37</sup> Jeremy Herb and Marshall Cohen, The Trump Tower Meeting: A Timeline, *CNN*, Jul. 31, 2018, <https://www.cnn.com/2018/07/31/politics/trump-tower-meeting-timeline/index.html>. (The fact that this meeting took place is not publicly known until it is reported by *The New York Times* on July 8, 2017. See Jo Becker, Matt Apuzzo and Adam Goldman, Trump Team Met with Lawyer Linked to Kremlin During Campaign, *New York Times*, Jul. 8, 2017, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/07/08/us/politics/trump-russia-kushner-manafort.html>.)

<sup>38</sup> Neil MacFarquhar and Andrew E. Kramer, Natalia Veselnitskaya, Lawyer Who Met Trump Jr., Seen as Fearsome Moscow Insider, *New York Times*, Jul. 11, 2017, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/07/11/world/europe/natalia-veselnitskaya-donald-trump-jr-russian-lawyer.html>.

<sup>39</sup> Andrew E. Kramer and Sharon LaFraniere, Lawyer Who Was Said to Have Dirt on Clinton Had Closer Ties to Kremlin Than She Let On, *New York Times*, Apr. 27, 2018, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/04/27/us/natalya-veselnitskaya-trump-tower-russian-prosecutorgeneral.html>.

<sup>40</sup> Sharon LaFraniere, David D. Kirkpatrick and Kenneth P. Vogel, Lobbyist at Trump Campaign

Manafort's notes from this meeting, which he took on his smartphone, may reference political contributions.<sup>41</sup> In a later interview, Veselnitskaya says that she went to the meeting to show campaign officials that Democratic donors had evaded U.S. taxes and to lobby against the Magnitsky Act, which imposes travel and financial restrictions on Russian and other foreign officials suspected of human rights abuses.<sup>42</sup> According to Veselnitskaya, Trump Jr. said, "Looking ahead, if we come to power, we can return to this issue and think what to do about it" and "I understand our side may have messed up, but it'll take a long time to get to the bottom of it." Veselnitskaya also claims that Trump Jr. asked for financial documents showing that the Clinton campaign had received money that allegedly evaded U.S. taxes (which she didn't have).<sup>43</sup>

**June 14, 2016:** *The Washington Post* reports that Russian government hackers infiltrated the Democratic National Committee (DNC)'s computer networks.<sup>44</sup>

**June 2016:** Trump campaign officials meet with officials from the Republican National Committee and Cambridge Analytica, a London-based company that focuses on psychological profiling and targeting of voters. Sometime between June and August 2016, the campaign hires Cambridge Analytica.<sup>45</sup>

**July to November 2016:** Internet Research Agency continues its efforts to interfere with the election by encouraging U.S. minority groups not to vote in the 2016 election and promoting allegations of voter fraud by the Democratic Party.<sup>46</sup>

**July 7, 2016:** Paul Manafort contacts Konstantin Kilimnik and asks that a message be sent to Oleg Deripaska, a Russian aluminum magnate who is seen as an ally of President Putin.

---

Meeting Has a Web of Russian Connections, *New York Times*, Aug. 21, 2017, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/21/us/rinat-akhmetshin-russia-trumpmeeting.html>.

<sup>41</sup> Ken Dilanian and Carol E. Lee, Manafort Notes from Russian Meet Refer to Political Contributions, *NBC News*, Sept. 1, 2017, <https://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/manafort-notes-russianmeet-contain-cryptic-reference-donations-n797816>; but see Philip Bump, What Paul Manafort's Trump Tower notes mean, May 16, 2018, *Washington Post*, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/politics/wp/2018/05/16/what-paul-manaforts-trump-tower-notes-mean/?utm\\_term=.7720408ead8e](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/politics/wp/2018/05/16/what-paul-manaforts-trump-tower-notes-mean/?utm_term=.7720408ead8e) (suggesting alternative explanation).

<sup>42</sup> Irina Reznik and Henry Meyer, Trump Jr. Hinted at Review of Anti-Russia Law, Moscow Lawyer Says, *Bloomberg*, Nov. 6, 2017, <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-11-06/trumpjr-said-anti-russia-law-may-be-reviewed-moscow-lawyer-says>; Alex Horton, The Magnitsky Act, Explained, *Washington Post*, Jul. 14, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/theworldfix/wp/2017/07/14/the-magnitsky-act-explained/?utm\\_term=.0a5c52b6ecb6](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/theworldfix/wp/2017/07/14/the-magnitsky-act-explained/?utm_term=.0a5c52b6ecb6).

<sup>43</sup> Reznik and Meyer, *Bloomberg*, Nov. 6, 2017.

<sup>44</sup> Ellen Nakashima, Russian Government Hackers Penetrated DNC, Stole Opposition Research on Trump, *Washington Post*, Jun. 14, 2016, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/nationalsecurity/russian-government-hackers-penetrated-dnc-stole-opposition-research-ontrump/2016/06/14/cf006cb4-316e-11e6-8ff7-7b6c1998b7a0\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.c7b43b7f98e7](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/nationalsecurity/russian-government-hackers-penetrated-dnc-stole-opposition-research-ontrump/2016/06/14/cf006cb4-316e-11e6-8ff7-7b6c1998b7a0_story.html?utm_term=.c7b43b7f98e7).

<sup>45</sup> Kenneth P. Vogel and Darren Samuelsohn, Trump's Secret Data Reversal, *Politico*, Jun. 28, 2016, <https://www.politico.com/story/2016/06/donald-trump-tech-data-fundraising-224865>; Eliana Johnson, Trump Campaign Turns to 'Psychographic' Data Firm Used by Cruz, *National Review*, Aug. 5, 2016, <https://www.nationalreview.com/2016/08/trump-campaignsdata-firm-partner-cambridge-analytica-worked-cruz/>.

<sup>46</sup> Russian Interference Indictment at ¶¶ 46-47.

Manafort appears to tell Kilimnik that he can arrange “private briefings” for Deripaska on campaign activities if needed.<sup>47</sup> (No evidence has emerged that these briefings in fact took place).

**July 7-8, 2016:** Carter Page, a foreign policy adviser to the Trump campaign, visits Moscow to give a lecture in which he is critical of U.S. policy toward Russia. During the trip, Page meets with Russian Deputy Prime Minister Arkady Dvorkovich. (When describing this meeting in later testimony, Page says, “I briefly said hello.”)<sup>48</sup>

In a memo to the campaign conveying the results of his trip, Page states that “In a private conversation, Dvorkovich expressed strong support for Mr. Trump and a desire to work together toward devising better solutions in response to the vast range of current international problems.”<sup>49</sup> In an email to Trump campaign associate J.D. Gordon and (at the time) Breitbart columnist Tera Dahl, Page also writes, “On a related front, I’ll send you guys a readout soon regarding some incredible insights and outreach I’ve received from a few Russian legislators and senior members of the Presidential administration here.”<sup>50</sup>

**July 11-12, 2016:** Trump campaign officials reportedly work behind the scenes at the Republican National Convention to strip a provision of the foreign policy platform that would have called for providing weapons to Ukraine to fight Russian and Russian-backed forces.<sup>51</sup> According to two Republican delegates, Trump campaign official J.D. Gordon led the efforts to make the change. Minutes taken for the meeting were reportedly discarded.<sup>52</sup>

**July 14, 2016:** Carter Page emails other Trump foreign policy advisers including J.D. Gordon that says, “As for the Ukraine amendment, excellent work.”<sup>53</sup>

---

<sup>47</sup> Hamburger, Helderman, Leonnig and Entous, *Washington Post*, Sept. 20, 2017.

<sup>48</sup> Sophie Tatum and Jim Sciutto, Carter Page Met with Russian Official During 2016 Trip to Moscow, *CNN*, Nov. 4, 2017, <https://www.cnn.com/2017/11/03/politics/carter-page-russian-officialsnew-york-times/index.html>; Steven Mufson and Tom Hamburger, Trump Adviser’s Public Comments, Ties to Moscow Stir Unease in Both Parties, *Washington Post*, Aug. 5, 2016, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/business/economy/trump-advisers-public-comments-ties-to-moscow-stir-unease-in-both-parties/2016/08/05/2e8722fa-5815-11e6-9aee-8075993d73a2\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.5ea68edcfe71](https://www.washingtonpost.com/business/economy/trump-advisers-public-comments-ties-to-moscow-stir-unease-in-both-parties/2016/08/05/2e8722fa-5815-11e6-9aee-8075993d73a2_story.html?utm_term=.5ea68edcfe71); Testimony of Carter Page at 12, *U.S. House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence*, Nov. 2, 2017, (henceforth “Page Testimony”), [https://intelligence.house.gov/uploadedfiles/carter\\_page\\_hpsci\\_hearing\\_transcript\\_nov\\_2\\_2017.pdf](https://intelligence.house.gov/uploadedfiles/carter_page_hpsci_hearing_transcript_nov_2_2017.pdf). Note that all page citations refer to transcript pagination, not that of the pdf.

<sup>49</sup> Page Testimony at 38.

<sup>50</sup> *Id.* at 40; Ryan Lucas, Former Trump Campaign National Security Adviser Had Worried About Page’s Moscow Trip, *NPR*, Nov. 10, 2017, <https://www.npr.org/2017/11/10/563154605/former-trump-campaign-national-security-adviser-had-worried-about-pages-moscow-t>.

<sup>51</sup> See Josh Rogin, Trump Campaign Guts GOP’s Anti-Russia Stance on Ukraine, *Washington Post*, Jul. 18, 2016, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/global-opinions/trump-campaignguts-gops-anti-russia-stance-on-ukraine/2016/07/18/98adb3b0-4cf3-11e6-a7d8-13d06b37f256\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.1f71ad368e6e](https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/global-opinions/trump-campaignguts-gops-anti-russia-stance-on-ukraine/2016/07/18/98adb3b0-4cf3-11e6-a7d8-13d06b37f256_story.html?utm_term=.1f71ad368e6e); Tim Mak and Alexa Corse, Trump Campaign Changed Ukraine Platform, Lied About It, *Daily Beast*, Aug. 3, 2016, <https://www.thedailybeast.com/trump-campaign-changed-ukraine-platform-lied-about-it>.

<sup>52</sup> Mak and Corse, *Daily Beast*, Aug. 3, 2016.

<sup>53</sup> Page Testimony at 195.



**July 18, 2016:** Senator Jeff Sessions speaks with Russian Ambassador Kislyak and several other foreign ambassadors after a Heritage Foundation panel on European relations during the Republican National Convention.<sup>54</sup>

On the same day, WikiLeaks responds to the Russian military officers posing as Guccifer 2.0 to state that WikiLeaks has possession of “the 1Gb or so archive” and would make a release of the stolen documents “this week.”<sup>55</sup>

**July 21, 2016:** Donald Trump officially accepts the Republican party’s nomination for president.<sup>56</sup>

**July 22, 2016:** WikiLeaks publishes a collection of the hacked DNC emails and documents.<sup>57</sup>

**July 27, 2016:** At a press conference, Donald Trump says, “Russia, if you’re listening, I hope you’re able to find the 30,000 emails that are missing.”<sup>58</sup> On the same day, Russian military officers for the first time attempt to spearphish email accounts used by Clinton’s personal office. They also attack 76 email addresses associated with the Clinton campaign.<sup>59</sup>

**August 2016:** Alexander Nix, the chief executive of Cambridge Analytica, and top Donald Trump donor Rebekah Mercer, email about whether they can better organize emails released by WikiLeaks.<sup>60</sup> Nix reportedly relays “that he had emailed Assange seeking access to emails from Clinton’s private server to turn them into a searchable database for the campaign or a pro-Trump political action committee.”<sup>61</sup>

---

<sup>54</sup> Adam Entous, Ellen Nakashima and Greg Miller, Sessions Met with Russian Envoy Twice Last Year, Encounters He Later Did Not Disclose, *Washington Post*, Mar. 1, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/sessions-spoke-twice-with-russian-ambassador-during-trumps-presidential-campaign-justice-officials-say/2017/03/01/77205eda-feac-11e6-99b4-9e613afeb09f\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.fc2cb232a6e6](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/sessions-spoke-twice-with-russian-ambassador-during-trumps-presidential-campaign-justice-officials-say/2017/03/01/77205eda-feac-11e6-99b4-9e613afeb09f_story.html?utm_term=.fc2cb232a6e6); Philip Bump, What Jeff Sessions Said about Russia, and When, *Washington Post*, Mar. 2, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/politics/wp/2017/03/02/what-jeff-sessions-said-about-russia-and-when/?utm\\_term=.989068c772da](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/politics/wp/2017/03/02/what-jeff-sessions-said-about-russia-and-when/?utm_term=.989068c772da).

<sup>55</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 47b.

<sup>56</sup> Stephen Collinson, Donald Trump Accepts Presidential Nomination, *CNN*, Jul. 22, 2016, <http://www.cnn.com/2016/07/21/politics/republican-convention-highlights-day-four/index.html>.

<sup>57</sup> Joe Uchill, WikiLeaks Posts 20,000 DNC Emails, *The Hill*, Jul. 22, 2016, <http://thehill.com/policy/cybersecurity/288883-wikileaks-posts-20000-dnc-emails>.

<sup>58</sup> Ashley Parker and David E. Sanger, Donald Trump Calls on Russia to Find Hillary Clinton’s Missing Emails, *New York Times*, Jul. 27, 2016, [https://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/28/us/politics/donald-trump-russia-clinton-emails.html?\\_r=0](https://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/28/us/politics/donald-trump-russia-clinton-emails.html?_r=0).

<sup>59</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 22.

<sup>60</sup> Rebecca Ballhaus, Trump Donor Asked Data Firm If It Could Better Organize Hacked Emails, *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 27, 2017, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/trump-donor-asked-data-firm-if-it-could-better-organize-hacked-emails-1509133587>.

<sup>61</sup> Kara Scannell, Dana Bash and Marshall Cohen, Trump Campaign Analytics Company Contacted WikiLeaks About Clinton Emails, *CNN*, Oct. 25, 2017, <http://www.cnn.com/2017/10/25/politics/cambridge-analytica-julian-assange-wikileaks-clintonemails/index.html>.

**August 4, 2016:** Internet Research Agency creates and purchases Facebook ads for a “Florida Goes Trump” rally. The ads reach over 59,000 Facebook users and over 8,300 Facebook users click on the ads.<sup>62</sup>

The same day, Stone appears on the show InfoWars. He describes the as-yet undisclosed WikiLeaks as “devastating” and mentions he had talked to then-nominee Trump the day before.<sup>63</sup> Stone also writes an email to Trump adviser Sam Nunberg saying, “I dined with my new pal Julian Assange last nite [sic].” Stone later says the email was a joke and denies meeting with or communicating with Assange in 2016.<sup>64</sup>

**August 8, 2016:** In a speech to the Southwest Broward Republican Organization, Roger Stone says that he “actually ha[s] communicated with Assange” and that he “believe[s] the next tranche of his documents pertain to the Clinton Foundation but there’s no telling what the October surprise may be.”<sup>65</sup>

**August 12, 2016:** On the #MAGA Podcast, Roger Stone states that he thinks Assange has Clinton emails that were deleted by Huma Abedin and Cheryl Mills, two of Clinton’s top aides. Stone adds, “In fact I know [Assange] has them.” He continues, “And I believe he will expose the American people to this information in the next 90 days.”<sup>66</sup>

**August 14, 2016:** *The New York Times* reports that Ukraine’s newly formed National Anti-Corruption Bureau has unearthed ledgers showing \$12.7 million in undisclosed cash payments designated for Paul Manafort from former Ukraine President Viktor Yanukovich’s pro-Russian political party.<sup>67</sup> In the same story, *The New York Times* also reports that Ukrainian investigators are looking into a group of shell companies that engaged in shady transactions, including an “\$18 million deal to sell Ukrainian cable television assets to a partnership put together by Mr. Manafort and a Russian oligarch, Oleg Deripaska . . . .”<sup>68</sup> On the same day, Roger Stone

---

<sup>62</sup> Russian Interference Indictment at ¶ 71.

<sup>63</sup> Andrew Kaczynski and Gloria Borger, Stone, On Day He Sent Assange Dinner Email, Also Said ‘Devastating’ WikiLeaks Were Forthcoming, *CNN*, Apr. 4, 2018, <https://www.cnn.com/2018/04/04/politics/roger-stone-julian-assange-email-wikileaks/index.html>.

<sup>64</sup> Shelby Holliday and Rob Barry, Roger Stone’s Claim of a 2016 Julian Assange Meeting Draws Scrutiny, *Wall Street Journal*, Apr. 2, 2018, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/roger-stones-claimof-a-2016-julian-assange-meeting-draws-scrutiny-1522695471>.

<sup>65</sup> Roger Stone Confirms That He’s In Communication With Julian Assange, *Media Matters*, Aug. 9, 2016, <https://www.mediamatters.org/video/2016/08/09/roger-stone-confirms-hes-communication-julian-assange/212261>; see also Tom Hamburger, Josh Dawsey, Carol D. Leonnig and Shane Harris, Roger Stone Claimed Contact with WikiLeaks Founder Julian Assange in 2016, According to Two Associates, *Washington Post*, Mar. 13, 2018, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/rogerstone-claimed-contact-with-wikileaks-founder-julian-assange-in-2016-according-to-twoassociates/2018/03/13/a263f842-2604-11e8-b79d-f3d931db7f68\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.e61b9f0e3477](https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/rogerstone-claimed-contact-with-wikileaks-founder-julian-assange-in-2016-according-to-twoassociates/2018/03/13/a263f842-2604-11e8-b79d-f3d931db7f68_story.html?utm_term=.e61b9f0e3477).

<sup>66</sup> Andrew Kaczynski, Nathan McDermott and Chris Massie, Trump Adviser Roger Stone Repeatedly Claimed to Know of Forthcoming WikiLeaks Dumps, *CNN*, Mar. 20, 2017, <http://www.cnn.com/2017/03/20/politics/kfile-roger-stone-wikileaks-claims/index.html>.

<sup>67</sup> Andrew E. Kramer, Mike McIntire and Barry Meier, Secret Ledger in Ukraine Lists Cash for Donald Trump’s Campaign Chief, *New York Times*, Aug. 14, 2016, <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/08/15/us/politics/paul-manafort-ukraine-donald-trump.html>.

<sup>68</sup> *Id.*

communicates via direct messages with DNC hacker Guccifer 2.0. Stone reportedly tells the hacker he is “delighted” that Twitter reinstated Guccifer’s account.<sup>69</sup>

**August 15, 2016:** Russian military officers, posing as Guccifer 2.0, send Roger Stone a direct message via Twitter: “thank u for writing back . . . do u find anyt[h]ing interesting in the docs i posted?”<sup>70</sup>

**August 17, 2016:** Guccifer 2.0 sends Roger Stone a direct message via Twitter: “please tell me if i can help you in anyhow . . . it would be a great pleasure to me.”<sup>71</sup>

**August 21, 2016:** Roger Stone tweets, “Trust me, it will soon [be] Podesta’s time in the barrel.”<sup>72</sup>

**September 9, 2016:** Guccifer 2.0 sends Roger Stone a direct message via Twitter. The two discuss Democratic voter turnout methods.<sup>73</sup> Roger Stone responds that the Democrat’s turnout model is “[p]retty standard.”<sup>74</sup>

**September 16, 2016:** Roger Stone reveals in a radio interview that he expects Julian Assange and WikiLeaks to “drop a payload of new documents on a weekly basis fairly soon.” He adds, “And that of course will answer the question of exactly what was erased on that email server.” Stone adds that he is “in touch with [Assange] through an intermediary.”<sup>75</sup>

**September 20, 2016:** Donald Trump Jr. reportedly receives a private message on Twitter from the WikiLeaks Twitter account, stating, “A PAC run anti-Trump site putintrump.org is about to launch. The PAC is a recycled pro-Iraq war PAC. We have guessed the password. It is ‘putintrump.’ See ‘About’ for who is behind it. Any comments?”<sup>76</sup>

---

<sup>69</sup> Andrew Blake, Roger Stone, Trump Confidant, Acknowledges ‘Innocuous’ Twitter Conversation with DNC Hackers, *Washington Times*, Mar. 10, 2017, <https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2017/mar/10/roger-stone-trump-confidant-acknowledgesinnocuous/>.

<sup>70</sup> Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 44; Devlin Barrett and Matt Zapotosky, Mueller Probe Indicts 12 Russians with Hacking of Democrats in 2016, *Washington Post*, Jul. 13, 2018, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/rod-rosenstein-expected-to-announce-newindictment-by-mueller/2018/07/13/bc565582-86a9-11e8-8553-a3ce89036c78\\_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/rod-rosenstein-expected-to-announce-newindictment-by-mueller/2018/07/13/bc565582-86a9-11e8-8553-a3ce89036c78_story.html).

<sup>71</sup> *Id.*; see also Minority Views re: Report on Russian Active Measures at 35.

<sup>72</sup> Philip Bump, The Confusing Timeline on Roger Stone’s Communications with WikiLeaks, *Washington Post*, Mar. 13, 2018, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/politics/wp/2018/03/13/the-confusing-timeline-on-roger-stonescommunications-with-wikileaks/?utm\\_term=.3c40e7c8d4a0](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/politics/wp/2018/03/13/the-confusing-timeline-on-roger-stonescommunications-with-wikileaks/?utm_term=.3c40e7c8d4a0).

<sup>73</sup> Minority Views re: Report on Russian Active Measures at 35.

<sup>74</sup> *Id.*; Netyksho Indictment at ¶ 44; Ali Dukakis, Roger Stone Says He’s the ‘US person’ Mentioned in Mueller Indictment, *ABC News*, Jul. 14, 2018, <https://abcnews.go.com/Politics/roger-stone-hes-us-personmentioned-mueller-indictment/story?id=56577300>.

<sup>75</sup> Kaczynski, McDermott and Massie, *CNN*, Mar. 20, 2017.

<sup>76</sup> Julia Ioffe, The Secret Correspondence Between Donald Trump Jr. and Wikileaks, *The Atlantic*, Nov. 13, 2017, <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/11/the-secret-correspondencebetween-donald-trump-jr-and-wikileaks/545738/>.

**September 21, 2016:** Trump Jr. responds to WikiLeaks on Twitter: “Off the record I don’t know who that is, but I’ll ask around. Thanks.”<sup>77</sup>

**October 7, 2016:** In the Obama administration’s first public remarks about Russia’s interference in the election, the Department of Homeland Security and the Office of the Director of National Intelligence on Election Security release a joint statement that reads in part,

“The U.S. Intelligence Community (USIC) is confident that the Russian Government directed the recent compromises of e-mails from US persons and institutions, including from US political organizations. The recent disclosures of alleged hacked e-mails on sites like DCLeaks.com and WikiLeaks and by the Guccifer 2.0 online persona are consistent with the methods and motivations of Russian-directed efforts. These thefts and disclosures are intended to interfere with the US election process. Such activity is not new to Moscow—the Russians have used similar tactics and techniques across Europe and Eurasia, for example, to influence public opinion there. We believe, based on the scope and sensitivity of these efforts, that only Russia’s senior-most officials could have authorized these activities.”<sup>78</sup>

Later the same day, WikiLeaks begins publishing the emails of John Podesta, Hillary Clinton’s campaign manager.<sup>79</sup> WikiLeaks’s release comes less than an hour<sup>80</sup> after *The Washington Post* publishes a video showing Trump bragging that he assaults women during a 2005 appearance on Access Hollywood.<sup>81</sup>

**October 10, 2016:** At a rally on October 10, Trump proclaims, “I love WikiLeaks!”<sup>82</sup>

**October 11, 2016:** Trump tweets,



<sup>77</sup> *Id.*

<sup>78</sup> Joint Statement from the Department Of Homeland Security and Office of the Director of National Intelligence on Election Security, Oct. 7, 2016, <https://www.dhs.gov/news/2016/10/07/jointstatement-department-homeland-security-and-office-director-national>.

<sup>79</sup> Eric Lipton, David E. Sanger and Scott Shane, The Perfect Weapon: How Russian Cyberpower Invaded the U.S., *New York Times*, Dec. 13, 2016, <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/12/13/us/politics/russia-hack-election-dnc.html>.

<sup>80</sup> Aaron Sharockman, It’s True: WikiLeaks Dumped Podesta Emails Hour After Trump Video Surfaced, *Politifact*, Dec. 18, 2016, <http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2016/dec/18/johnpodesta/its-true-wikileaks-dumped-podesta-emails-hour-afte/>.

<sup>81</sup> Watch: Donald Trump Recorded Having Extremely Lewd Conversation About Women in 2005, *Washington Post*, Oct. 7, 2016, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/video/national/watchdonald-trump-recorded-having-extremely-lewd-conversation-about-women-in-2005/2016/10/07/3bf16d1e8caf-11e6-8cdc-4fbb1973b506\\_video.html?utm\\_term=.81d63f2a6ab5](https://www.washingtonpost.com/video/national/watchdonald-trump-recorded-having-extremely-lewd-conversation-about-women-in-2005/2016/10/07/3bf16d1e8caf-11e6-8cdc-4fbb1973b506_video.html?utm_term=.81d63f2a6ab5).

<sup>82</sup> Mark Hensch, Trump: ‘I love WikiLeaks’, *The Hill*, Oct. 10, 2016, <http://thehill.com/blogs/ballot-box/presidential-races/300327-trump-i-love-wikileaks>.

**October 12, 2016:** WikiLeaks again messages Trump Jr. on Twitter: “Hey Donald, great to see you and your dad talking about our publications.” WikiLeaks continues, “Strongly suggest your dad tweets this link if he mentions us.” The message also included this link: “wlsearch.tk.” WikiLeaks continued, “There’s many great stories the press are missing and we’re sure some of your follows [sic] will find it.” And “Btw we just released Podesta Emails Part 4.”<sup>84</sup> Fifteen minutes after it was sent, candidate Trump tweeted, “Very little pick-up by the dishonest media of incredible information provided by WikiLeaks. So dishonest! Rigged system!”<sup>85</sup>

**October 13, 2016:** WikiLeaks exchanges private messages with Roger Stone. Stone writes to WikiLeaks, “Since I was all over national TV, cable and print defending [W]ikileaks and [A]ssange against the claim that you are Russian agents and debunking the false charges of sexual assault as trumped up bs you may want to reexamine the strategy of attacking me-cordially R.” The WikiLeaks account responds, “We appreciate that. However, the false claims of association are being used by the [D]emocrats to undermine the impact of our publications. Don’t go there if you don’t want us to correct you.”<sup>86</sup>

**October 14, 2016:** Trump Jr. tweets a link that WikiLeaks had provided to him: “For those who have the time to read about all the corruption and hypocrisy all the @wikileaks emails are right here: <http://wlsearch.tk/>”



87

**October 15, 2016:** Stone again messages WikiLeaks on Twitter: “Ha! The more you ‘correct’ me the more people think you’re lying. Your operation leaks like a sieve. You need to figure out who your friends are.”<sup>88</sup>

**November 9, 2016:** Donald Trump is declared winner of the November 8 election and becomes president-elect of the United States. Soon afterwards, President-elect Trump begins receiving regular security briefings.<sup>89</sup>

<sup>83</sup> <https://twitter.com/realdonaldtrump/status/785898532645502980>.

<sup>84</sup> Ioffe, *The Atlantic*, Nov. 13, 2017.

<sup>85</sup> *Id.*; <https://twitter.com/realdonaldtrump/status/786201435486781440>.

<sup>86</sup> Natasha Bertrand, *Roger Stone’s Secret Messages with WikiLeaks*, *The Atlantic*, Feb. 27, 2018, <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/02/roger-stones-secret-messages-withwikileaks/554432/>.

<sup>87</sup> <https://twitter.com/DonaldJTrumpJr/status/786923210512142336>.

<sup>88</sup> Bertrand, *The Atlantic*, Feb. 27, 2018.

<sup>89</sup> Mark Hosenball, *Donald Trump Set To Receive Top Secret Security Briefings*, *Huffington Post*, Nov. 10, 2016, [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/trump-securitybriefings\\_us\\_5823dcbfe4b0d9ce6fc0cb09](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/trump-securitybriefings_us_5823dcbfe4b0d9ce6fc0cb09).



The same day, Guccifer 2.0 sends Roger Stone a direct message via Twitter: “Happy? We are now more free to communicate.”<sup>90</sup>

**December 1, 2016:** Jared Kushner and Michael Flynn meet with Kislyak at Trump Tower in New York City. During the meeting, Kushner, Flynn, and Kislyak reportedly “discuss[] the possibility of setting up a secret and secure communications channel between Trump’s transition team and the Kremlin . . . .”<sup>91</sup>

**December 13, 2016:** Kushner meets with Sergey Gorkov, the chief executive of Vnesheconombank, a Russian-state-owned bank that had been sanctioned by the Obama Administration. *The Washington Post* later reports that the White House and the Russian bank later gave different explanations for the purpose of this meetings: “The bank maintained . . . that the session was held as part of a new business strategy and was conducted with Kushner in his role as the head of his family’s real estate business. The White House says the meeting was unrelated to business and was one of many diplomatic encounters the soon-to-be presidential adviser was holding ahead of Trump’s inauguration.”<sup>92</sup>

**January 11, 2017:** Trump ally Erik Prince meets with Kirill Dmitriev, head of a sanctioned Russian sovereign wealth fund, in the Seychelles, along with George Nader, a Lebanese-American businessman who advises the crown prince of the United Arab Emirates.<sup>93</sup> Reportedly, Dmitriev later memorialized the discussion in summary as proposing four areas for future U.S.-Russia cooperation: “military coordination and joint actions in Syria against ISIS,” including a “joint special forces mission” and resumption of intelligence-sharing; cooperation on nuclear non-proliferation, perhaps including supporting efforts to purchase low-enriched uranium in Kazakhstan; using the Russian sovereign wealth fund to create jobs in “the U.S. market in the Midwest” and to subsidize U.S. businesses operating in Russia; and addressing “differences

---

<sup>90</sup> Minority Views re: Report on Russian Active Measures at 35.

<sup>91</sup> Ellen Nakashima, Adam Entous and Greg Miller, Russian Ambassador Told Moscow that Kushner Wanted Secret Communications Channel with Kremlin, *Washington Post*, May 26, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/russian-ambassador-told-moscow-that-kushnerwanted-secret-communications-channel-with-kremlin/2017/05/26/520a14b4-422d-11e7-9869-bac8b446820a\\_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/russian-ambassador-told-moscow-that-kushnerwanted-secret-communications-channel-with-kremlin/2017/05/26/520a14b4-422d-11e7-9869-bac8b446820a_story.html); Devlin Barrett, Philip Rucker and Karoun Demirjian, Kushner Questioned by Senate Investigators on Russia, *Washington Post*, Jul. 24, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/kushner-arrives-at-senate-for-closed-doorquestioning-on-russia/2017/07/24/f5be2b26-7073-11e7-8f39-eeb7d3a2d304\\_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/kushner-arrives-at-senate-for-closed-doorquestioning-on-russia/2017/07/24/f5be2b26-7073-11e7-8f39-eeb7d3a2d304_story.html).

<sup>92</sup> David Filipov, Amy Brittain, Rosalind S. Helderman and Tom Hamburger, Explanations for Kushner’s Meeting with Head of Kremlin-Linked Bank Don’t Match Up, *Washington Post*, Jun. 1, 2017, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/explanations-for-kushners-meeting-with-head-of-kremlin-linked-bank-dont-match-up/2017/06/01/dd1bdbb0-460a-11e7-bcde624ad94170ab\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.fbd753b69cd6](https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/explanations-for-kushners-meeting-with-head-of-kremlin-linked-bank-dont-match-up/2017/06/01/dd1bdbb0-460a-11e7-bcde624ad94170ab_story.html?utm_term=.fbd753b69cd6); Barret, Rucker and Demirjian, *Washington Post*, Jul. 24, 2017.

<sup>93</sup> Sari Horwitz and Devlin Barrett, Mueller gathers evidence that 2017 Seychelles meeting was effort to establish back channel to Kremlin, *Washington Post*, Mar. 7, 2018, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/mueller-gathers-evidence-that-2016-seychelles-meeting-was-effort-to-establish-back-channel-to-kremlin/2018/03/07/b6a5fb8c-224b-11e8-94da-ebf9d112159c\\_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/mueller-gathers-evidence-that-2016-seychelles-meeting-was-effort-to-establish-back-channel-to-kremlin/2018/03/07/b6a5fb8c-224b-11e8-94da-ebf9d112159c_story.html).

and concerns” such as the Ukraine crisis “through Minsk [peace] agreements and ensuring Ukraine fulfills its commitments.”<sup>94</sup>

**Late January/Early February 2017:** National Security Advisor Michael Flynn reportedly pushes to expand a narrow military communications channel used by U.S. and Russian military aircraft to avoid collisions to be used for higher-level military communications that, he hoped, would lead to the U.S. military working more closely with the Russian military in Syria.<sup>95</sup> Flynn is fired shortly thereafter, and no further action is taken on this idea.<sup>96</sup>

\*

**Barry H. Berke** is co-chair of the litigation department at Kramer Levin Naftalis & Frankel LLP (Kramer Levin) and a fellow of the American College of Trial Lawyers. He has represented public officials, professionals and other clients in matters involving all aspects of white-collar crime, including conspiracy charges. **Dani R. James** is a former federal prosecutor and a current partner at Kramer Levin where she co-chairs the white collar defense and investigations group. She too has represented clients in matters involving all aspects of white-collar crime. **Noah Bookbinder** is the Executive Director of Citizens for Responsibility and Ethics in Washington (CREW). Previously, Noah has served as Chief Counsel for Criminal Justice for the United States Senate Judiciary Committee and as a corruption prosecutor in the United States Department of Justice’s Public Integrity Section. **Ambassador (ret.) Norman L. Eisen**, a senior fellow at the Brookings Institution, was the chief White House ethics lawyer from 2009 to 2011 and before that, defended obstruction and other criminal cases for almost two decades in a D.C. law firm specializing in white-collar matters. He is the chair and co-founder of CREW.

We are grateful to Michelle Ben-David, Sam Koch, Gabe Lezra, John McNulty, Nolan Robinson, Conor Shaw, Samuel Shepson, and Shaked Sivan for their invaluable assistance in preparing this report.

**The Brookings Institution** is a nonprofit organization devoted to independent research and policy solutions. Its mission is to conduct high-quality, independent research and, based on that research, to provide innovative, practical recommendations for policymakers and the public. CREW is a party in active litigation involving President Trump and the administration and Barry Berke and Kramer Levin are outside pro bono counsel to CREW. The authors have no other relevant interests to disclose.

The conclusions and recommendations of this publication are solely those of its authors and do not reflect the views of their institutional affiliations, nor do they reflect the views of the Brookings Institution, its management, or its other scholars.

---

<sup>94</sup> Betsy Woodruff and Erin Banco, Revealed: What Erik Prince and Moscow’s Money Man Discussed in That Infamous Seychelles Meeting, *Daily Beast*, Sept. 26, 2018, <https://www.thedailybeast.com/revealed-what-erik-prince-and-moscows-money-man-discussed-in-that-infamous-seychelles-meeting>.

<sup>95</sup> Spencer Ackerman, Michael Flynn Had a Plan to Work With Russia’s Military. It Wasn’t Exactly Legal, *Daily Beast*, Jun. 7, 2017, <https://www.thedailybeast.com/michael-flynn-had-a-plan-to-work-with-russias-military-it-wasnt-exactly-legal>.

<sup>96</sup> *Id.*