Financing Dies in Darkness? The Impact of Newspaper Closure on Public Finance

Pengjie Gao, Chang Lee and Dermot Murphy

Discussion by Leslie McGranahan, Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago 7th Annual Municipal Finance Conference, July 16-17, 2018

This presentation represents my own opinion and not the opinion of the Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago or of the Federal Reserve System

Main Conjecture Well Documented

- Newspapers think this is their role
 - "The Chicago Tribune is a citizen of Chicago, a newspaper committed to inform and lead public opinion, to foster commerce and industry, and **to furnish that vital check upon government which no constitution can.**"
- Following newspaper closure two things happen
 - Public finance spending increases
 - Wage bill, public employees increase, tax revenue up
 - Does population fall? (Numerator or denominator of for example county gov. wage bill/total wage bill)
 - Does overall borrowing increase (more issuance of debt)
 - This is not "inefficiency" but size consistent with lots of models of government
 - Municipal borrowing costs increase by 5-11 basis points
 - Craigslist instrument really cool

Further Questions primarily relate to the mechanism

- More detail about how the results inform the mechanism
 - When do things matter? Trace out the timing both relative to the issuance of the bond and relative to the closure of the paper.
 - Why following three year period? (Depends on mechanism.)
 - What about bonds issued before newspaper closure?
 - Bond ratings as dependent variable rather than control?
 - Not operating through ratings
 - Ratings agencies are other watchdog
 - Do you think this is about the structure and issuance of the debt itself, the credit worthiness of the issuer (risky), or the County • Municipal information set of the lenders?
- Can we learn anything based on level of government?
 - School districts still getting coverage, but lack of thoughtful analysis
 - In particular because many local issues are not topical enough for the dailies
 - Anything about weeklies?

Governments by Type, 2012

Town or

Township

School District



Some Other Thoughts

- Can we learn anything from other things these papers cover?
 - Local sports?
 - Obituaries?
- Who do you lose when you drop counties with three or more papers?
 - Is this a story about particular types of places. What places are at risk for closure. (For example have three not one paper?)
- Found "low isolation" vs "high isolation" state discussion unnecessary
 - Is there an way to also instrument with something related to housing market churn? Like migration? Advertising is now housing market.

Big Picture Thoughts

- Might pendulum be swinging in other direction?
 - Golden age of public radio
 - Constant consumption of news
 - The hyperlocal news
 - Not financially viable, more labors of love?
 - Serves different purpose?
 - Nextdoor