

# Contents

**Preface—a story about this book**      ix

**Acknowledgments**      xvii

## **Chapter 1**

**The process of government accountability—an anecdote and an agenda**      1

A critical focus—public expenditure management      3

Evolution of thinking on development and accountability      4

A simple model      7

A word of caution on a promising agenda      15

Notes      17

## **Chapter 2**

**Major issues and tools in public expenditure management**      18

Countries need a strategic approach to expenditure planning      18

The government's role is often too broad to be successful      19

Spending tends to be inefficient and inequitable      20

Decentralization of public spending creates practical problems      28

Budget execution and the expenditure framework are weak      33

Prospects for improving public financial management and procurement systems are mixed      42

What remains to be done      44

Notes      47

### Chapter 3

#### **The political dimension of public accountability 51**

Defining the problem	51
Applying the principal-agent framework to citizens seeking results from government	52
Charting the sources of accountability	55
Taking advantage of the changing world political context	58
Improving prospects for demand-driven accountability	62
Notes	65

### Chapter 4

#### **Transparency and accountability in budgets and expenditure management 66**

Making budgets clear and transparent	67
Analyzing performance and transparency in the budget process	68
Some success stories in budget execution—but more are needed	82
Notes	85

### Chapter 5

#### **Independent monitoring organizations at work 87**

What is an independent monitoring organization?	87
Putting independent monitoring organizations on the map	88
Engaging in a multiagent environment to improve transparency and accountability	89
Measuring the impact of independent monitoring organizations—some questions	103
Next steps for independent monitoring organizations	108
Notes	109

### Chapter 6

#### **Strengthening independent monitoring organizations 111**

Characteristics of a small group of independent monitoring organizations	112
Actions taken to strengthen independent monitoring organizations	123
Lessons for donors	129
Summary of lessons for improving the effectiveness of independent monitoring organizations	134
Notes	135

**Chapter 7****Conclusion—bringing everyone to the same page 136**

The story of the book	136
What can donors do?	138
What can independent monitoring organizations do?	140
What can governments do?	140
And finally, a ministry of finance perspective	141
Notes	145

**References 147****Index 157****Boxes**

1.1	What do we know about the links between transparency, public expenditure, and human development?	5
1.2	Introducing results-based budgeting in Peru	9
1.3	Improving the effectiveness of education spending in Kenya	11
1.4	Better outcomes with better governance in Indonesia	12
1.5	Increasing budgetary transparency in Paraguay	13
1.6	Shaping the dialogue on education spending in Ghana	15
2.1	Implementing food subsidy reform in Tunisia	29
2.2	The Ho Chi Minh City experiment	32
2.3	Aid dependence in Africa	36
2.4	Objectives of a medium-term expenditure framework	38
2.5	Comparing infrastructure services across 10 municipalities in Karnataka, India	46
3.1	Bottom-up accountability and interest group theory	58
3.2	Mobile success emerges amid the mayhem	60
3.3	Access to information laws	62
3.4	International standards and accountability	63
3.5	Trust in nongovernmental organizations among opinion leaders	64
4.1	Budget legislation reform in Turkey and Vietnam	84
5.1	Evolution from advocacy to independent monitoring organization—Developing Initiatives for Social and Human Action	94
5.2	Independent monitoring organizations and other expenditure analysis tools	96
5.3	Independent monitoring organizations and other routes of accountability	104
5.4	A legal model encourages civil society participation in Colombia	106
5.5	Demonstrating the impact of independent monitoring organizations in Mexico	109

- 
- 6.1 Reflections of former Nigerian Minister of Finance Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala on civil society organizations in the 2003–06 budget process 113
  - 6.2 Summary results and institutional management indicators in the Transparency and Accountability Project 115
  - 6.3 Examples of capacity-building programs for independent monitoring organizations 124
  - 6.4 Observations on the funding history of civil society organizations in India from Vinod Vyasulu, founder of the Center for Budget and Policy Analysis in Karnataka, India 126
- 

## Figures

- 1.1 A model of governance, public expenditure management, and the role of independent monitoring organizations 8
- 3.1 Routes of accountability for public entities 55
- 3.2 World Internet penetration rates vary widely, 2009 61
- 4.1 Best practices for budget process—reports and timeline 68
- 4.2 Budget document availability varies greatly for low- and middle-income countries, 2008 72
- 4.3 Few sample low- and middle-income countries release budgets with adequate time for legislative review, 2008 73
- 4.4 Few sample low- and middle-income countries present adequate program-level expenditures in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, 2008 75
- 4.5 Executive consultations with key stakeholders during budget prioritization are rare in sample low- and middle-income countries, 2008 75
- 4.6 Most legislatures in sample low- and middle-income countries have little or no authority to amend the budget, 2008 76
- 4.7 Both the frequency and detail of periodic budget reports in sample low- and middle-income countries fall short of monitoring requirements, 2008 78
- 4.8 Legislatures play a minor role in decisions on shifting funds between administrative units in sample low- and middle-income countries 79
- 4.9 Budgets of auditing institutions fall short of best practice in sample low- and middle-income countries, 2008 . . . 79
- 4.10 . . . and so does the timing of their reports, 2008 80
- 4.11 Most sample low- and middle-income countries provide little or no detail on differences between allocated and actual expenditures in year-end reports, 2008 81

---

4.12	Even fewer sample low- and middle-income countries explain gaps between allocated and actual expenditures to benefit impoverished populations in year-end reports, 2008	82
4.13	Few sample low- and middle-income countries include performance indicators in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, 2008	82
4.14	Even fewer sample low- and middle-income countries explain the differences between performance indicators and actual outcomes in year-end reports, 2008	83
5.1	Role of independent monitoring organizations in bottom-up accountability	90
5.2	Role of independent monitoring organizations in working with the public and the state	91
6.1	Sources of funds for sampled independent monitoring organizations in 2008	118
6.2	Communications approach on "hot topics," 2009	120
6.3	Importance of alternative audiences, 2009	121
6.4	Primary and secondary sources of information for the policy community, 2009	122

---

## Tables

2.1	Average estimated rates of return to schooling, by region, 1990s	21
2.2	Benefit incidence of public spending by income quintile, selected countries, 1990s	21
2.3	Incidence of social expenditure and energy subsidies in Ecuador by income quintile, 1999	23
2.4	Benefit incidence of public expenditure on education in Bangladesh, by consumption expenditure quintile, 2000	23
2.5	Recurrent public expenditure on education in Bangladesh, by level, 1991/92–1999/2000	24
2.6	Primary school salary costs as a share of recurrent expenditure on primary education, selected Sub-Saharan African countries, 2002–04	25
2.7	Student-teacher ratios by level of education, selected countries, circa 2000	26
2.8	Primary school teacher salaries as a multiple of GDP per capita, selected developing countries, circa 2000	27
2.9	Share of selected subsidies accruing to the poor and nonpoor in Iran, 1998	27
2.10	Benefit incidence of subsidies on basic services in Ecuador, by consumption expenditure quintile, 2003	28
2.11	Relative weight of local government budgets in selected West African countries, 1992	30

- 3.1 Agent selection methods for public expenditure functions 54
- 3.2 Policy and institutional features affecting public expenditure management agents 54
- 4.1 Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development best practices and the Open Budget Index 70