## A Crisis in Student Loans?

How Changes in the Characteristics of Borrowers and the Institutions they Attended Contributed to Rising Loan Defaults

## Adam Looney

## Constantine Yannelis

## Why Are Defaults Rising?



## Defining Traditional and Non-Traditional Borrowers

Number of Borrowers Entering Repayment (thousands)


## Changes in the Composition of Borrowers



## Non-traditional Borrowers: Lower-income, Independent, First-generation Students, with Low Completion Rates

Family Income


First Generation


Dependent


Completion


## Institutions Whose Students Owe the Most 2000

| Institution | Total Debt | Total Borrowers |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| New York University | $\$ 2,184,601$ | 72,650 |
| University of Phoenix | $\$ 2,099,828$ | 103,475 |
| Nova Southeastern | $\$ 1,736,919$ | 34,900 |
| Pennsylvania State University | $\$ 1,710,951$ | 123,800 |
| University of Southern California | $\$ 1,609,511$ | 51,525 |
| Ohio State University | $\$ 1,533,954$ | 82,250 |
| Temple University | $\$ 1,531,762$ | 59,900 |
| Arizona State University | $\$ 1,385,858$ | 70,675 |
| Michigan State University | $\$ 1,321,997$ | 65,650 |
| University of Minnesota-Twin Cities | $\$ 1,289,873$ | 66,675 |

## Institutions Whose Students Owe the Most 2014

| Institution | Total Debt | Total Borrowers |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| University of Phoenix | $\$ 35,529,283$ | $1,191,550$ |
| Walden University | $\$ 9,833,470$ | 120,275 |
| Nova Southeastern | $\$ 8,748,887$ | 94,350 |
| DeVry University | $\$ 8,249,788$ | 274,150 |
| Capella University | $\$ 8,043,635$ | 104,450 |
| Strayer University | $\$ 6,693,570$ | 144,400 |
| Kaplan University | $\$ 6,664,067$ | 220,125 |
| New York University | $\$ 6,307,264$ | 110,775 |
| Argosy University | $\$ 6,179,207$ | 104,325 |
| Ashford University | $\$ 5,891,799$ | 205,000 |

## Increase in Default Rates is Concentrated among Non-traditional Borrowers

## 3-Year Cohort Default Rate



## Many More are Not in Default but not Paying Down Loans

Borrowers Who Owe More in Second Year


## Relatively Poor Labor Market Outcomes of Non-traditional

 BorrowersMedian Annual Earnings of Borrowers, Two Years After Entering Repayment


## A Few Implications

- Default rates will improve.


## A Few Implications

- Default rates will improve.
- Most borrowers accumulate sustainable debts.
- Most student debt owed by high-income borrowers.


## Distribution of Debt by Income Class

## Federal Student Debt Owed by Earnings Quintile



## A Few Implications

- Default rates should improve.
- Most borrowers accumulate sustainable debts
- Most student debt owed by high-income borrowers.
...But not all
- Some borrowers accumulate large debts
- Challenges of non-traditional borrowers likely to persist and to remain policy issue


## Repayment and Default Rates Vary Widely by Institution (2009)

| Institution | Total Debt | 5-Year Default Rate | 5-Year \% Balance <br> Repaid |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University of Phoenix | $\$ 35,529,283$ | $45 \%$ | $1 \%$ |
| Walden University | $\$ 9,833,470$ | $7 \%$ | $0 \%$ |
| Nova Southeastern | $\$ 8,748,887$ | $6 \%$ | $-3 \%$ |
| DeVry University | $\$ 8,249,788$ | $43 \%$ | $-4 \%$ |
| Capella University | $\$ 8,043,635$ | $19 \%$ | $-5 \%$ |
| Strayer University | $\$ 6,693,570$ | $31 \%$ | $-6 \%$ |
| Kaplan University | $\$ 6,664,067$ | $53 \%$ | $0 \%$ |
| New York University | $\$ 6,307,264$ | $6 \%$ | $34 \%$ |
| Argosy University | $\$ 6,179,207$ | $15 \%$ | $-7 \%$ |
| Ashford University | $\$ 55,891,799$ | $47 \%$ | $2 \%$ |

## Borrowers at Selective Institutions have Higher Average Debt Burdens, but Balances at Non-Selective Institutions have Grown Faster



## The number of first-time borrowers jumped during the recession...



## ...and quickly became a rush of borrowers into loan repayment



