

Development and Resettlement in Comparative Context

Rhodes University

**Prof. Chris de Wet
2003
South Africa**

Course Description:

Development-induced displacement and resettlement (DIDR) is a type of forced migration, and refers to the situation whereby people have to move to make way for infrastructure development projects. Some ten million people are displaced each year in the face of projects, such as the construction of dams, irrigation schemes, conservation areas, urban renewal and housing schemes, water or transport supply systems, energy generation projects and open cast mining. DIDR has had overwhelmingly negative economic, health, psychological and social consequences for the vast majority of those displaced, has evoked widespread resistance, and has become a highly contentious and politicised issue. The last two decades have seen the development of policy guidelines by international bodies such as The World Bank and the OECD, as well as by several countries, resulting in positive outcomes in some cases. Deep divisions remain as to whether the model of development presupposed by DIDR is sustainable, whether the (usually involuntary) displacement to which it gives rise constitutes a serious violation of human rights, and whether it can ever be justified.

In this module, we look at theoretical perspectives on the nature of DIDR, and analyse examples from Africa and Asia. We ask whether and how we could translate the lessons learned from previous mistakes into sound policy which could improve the outcome for all concerned.

Outcomes

On completion of the work covered in this course, students will have

- a basic knowledge of the main theoretical approaches through which we seek to understand and improve DIDR
- a knowledge and understanding of different kinds of DIDR, and of the way they have taken shape in Africa and Asia
- an understanding of some of the complexities involved in trying to formulate and implement sound resettlement policy

Assessment

See general criteria for assessment on page B of this guide

Essays

ESSAY No DUE Friday 3 October, 12 Noon

1) Give an account of the socio-economic consequences of DIDR in ONE of the following cases of dam-related resettlement

- Aswan Dam, on the Sudanese side (Salem-Murdock 1985; Sorbo 1985)
- Akosombo Dam, Ghana (Diaw and Schmidt-Kallert 1990; Obusu-Mensah 1990)
- Manantali Dam, Mali (Grimm 1991; Horowitz et al 1993; Koenig and Horowitz 1988)
- Kariba Dam, Zambia/Zimbabwe (Colson 1971; Scudder 1985; World Commission on Dams 2000)

ESSAY No DUE Friday 24 October, 12 Noon

Write an essay on ONE of the following topics:

1) Give an account of the role of the Narmada Bachao Andolan (Save the Narmada River movement) in relation to the Indian government's project to build a series of dams on the Narmada River. In which ways has it a) advanced b) prejudiced, the interests of those people affected by the dams? What lessons does the NBA story hold for how people could best go about resisting resettlement?

(Baviskar 1995; Dreze et al 1997, ch 1–3; Parasuraman 1999, ch 9; Sangavi 2000)

2) Give an account of the socio-economic consequences of conservation-induced displacement and resettlement, comparing at least two African with two non-African cases.

(Chatty and Colchester 2002)

3) How does Sorenson see resettlement within the Mahaweli Project in Sri Lanka as 'an ongoing process of social reconstruction', and how does she see the role of the state in resettlement?

(Sorenson 1996)

Syllabus:

15 – 19 September

Tutorials: What is the role of the nation-state in forced displacement and its outcomes?

Readings: (Sorensen 1996, ch 3; Turton 2002)

Lectures: Understanding Development-Induced Displacement and Resettlement (DIDR)

Readings: (Cernea 2000; de Wet 2001; de Wet In Press; Downing 1995; Sorensen 1996, ch 8)

22 – 26 September

- Tutorials:** How does Scudder apply his model of resettlement as a process to the resettlement arising out of the construction of the Kariba Dam? How would Cernea apply his Risks and Reconstruction model to the same data? Are their two approaches compatible?
- Readings:** Cernea 2000; Scudder 1993
- Lectures:** Dam-Related Resettlement in Africa
- Readings:** de Wet 1999

29 September – 3 October

- Tutorials:** What happens to San/Bushmen nomadic hunter-gatherers when external forces constrain their nomadic life-style?
- Readings:** Guenther 2002; Smith et al 2000, ch 9, 10; Suzman 2000, ch 2, 7
- Lectures:** Conservation and/or Communities: Meru adaptation and resistance to the proclamation of the Arusha National Park in Tanzania
- Readings:** Neumann 1998, ch 3–6

6 – 10 October

- Tutorials:** How does Dwivedi conceptualise the nature of risk in resettlement, and how does this influence the way he analyses resistance in the Narmada context?
- Readings:** Dwivedi 1999
- Lectures:** Resettlement in India
a) Dam-Related Resettlement: Narmada/Sardar Sarovar
- Readings:** Baviskar 1995, ch 9; Dhagamwar 1995; Hakim 2000; Kala 2000; Parasuraman 1999, ch 9, 11
- Lectures:** b) Industrial Development-Related Resettlement in India
- Readings:** Parasuraman 1999, ch 4–6; Reddy 1994, ch 4, 5

13 – 17 October

- Tutorials:** How is globalisation likely to impact upon resettlement in China?
- Readings:** Jing 1999; Meikle and Zhu 2000
- Lectures:** Resettlement in China
a) Past Disasters and Progressive Policy Reforms
- Readings:** Jing 1999; Travers 1993; Shi and Chen 2000

- Lectures:** b) Some Subsequent Significant Successes: Shuikou and Xiaolangdi
- Readings:** Jing 1999; Trembath et al n.d.; Xiaolangdi reader 2002; World Bank 1998

20 – 24 October

- Tutorials:** South Africa does not have a resettlement policy. What are the ten most important points that such a policy should bear in mind? Bring your ten points to the tutorial, and we will show you why it is so difficult to formulate a good resettlement policy!

- Readings:** from the course as a whole

- Lectures:** Can we Improve Matters?
a) Resistance

- Readings:** Oliver-Smith 2001, ch 1, 6, 12

- Lectures:** b) Policy Issues

- Readings:** Trembath et al n.d.; World Bank 2002

Course Readings:**Readings**

Baviskar, A. (1997). *In The Belly of the River*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Chatty, D. & Colchester (ed) 2001. *Displacement, Forced Settlement and Conservation*. Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Colson, E. (1971). *The Social Consequences of Resettlement*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Diaw, K. and Schmidt-Kallert, E. (1990). *Effects of Volta Lake Resettlement in Ghana — a Reappraisal after 25 years*. Hamburg: Institut für Afrika-kunde.

Dreze, J., Samson, M. and Singh, S. 1997 *The dam and the nation: displacement and resettlement in the Narmada Valley*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Grimm, C.D. (1991). *Turmoil and Transformation : a Study of Population Relocation at Manantali, Mali*. Unpublished PhD thesis, State University of New York at Binghamton.

Horowitz, M.M., Koenig, D., Grimm, C. and Konate, Y. (1993). 'Resettlement at Manantali: Short-Term Success, Long-Term Problems'. In Cernea, M. and Guggenheim, S.E. (Ed 1993). *Anthropological Approaches to Resettlement — Policy, Theory and Practice*, pp 229 – 250. Boulder: Westview Press.

Koenig, D. and Horowitz, M.M. (1988). *Lessons of Manantali: a Preliminary Assessment of Involuntary Relocation in Manantali*. Working Paper No 43, Institute for Development Anthropology, Binghamton (USA).

Obosu-Mensah, K. (1990). *Ghana's Volta Resettlement Scheme — The Long-Term Consequences of Post Colonial State Planning*. Bethesda, Maryland: International Scholars Publications.

Oliver-Smith, O. (2001). *Displacement, Resistance and the Critique of Development : From the Grassroots to the Global*. Unpublished Report, Refugee Studies Centre, University of Oxford.

Parasuraman, S. (1997). 'The Anti-Dam Movement and Rehabilitation Policy' In Dreze, J. et al (ed 1997). *The Dam and the Nation: displacement and resettlement in the Narmada Valley*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Salem-Murdock, M. (1989). *Arabs and Nubians in New Halfa — a Study of Settlement and Irrigation*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press.

Sangvai, S. 2000. *The river and life: people's struggle in the Narmada Valley*. Mumbai: Earthcare Books.

Scudder, T. (1985). *A History of Development in the Twentieth Century: the Zambian Portion of the Middle Zambezi Valley and the Lake Kariba Basin*. Unpublished paper.

Sorbo, G.M. (1985). *Tenants and Nomads in Eastern Sudan — a Study of Economic Adaptions in the New Halfa Scheme*. Uppsala: Scandanavian Institute of African Studies.

Sorenson, B. (1996). *Relocated Lives: Displacement and Resettlement within the Mahaweli Project, Sri Lanka*. Amsterdam: V.U, Press.

World Commission on Dams (2000). *Kariba Dam Case Study: Zambia and Zimbabwe*. Draft: September 2000. World Commission on Dams: Cape Town.

Bibliography

Baviskar, A. (1997). *In The Belly of the River*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Cernea, M. (2000). 'Risks, Safeguards and Reconstruction: a Model for Population Displacement and Resettlement'. In Cernea, M. and McDowell, C. (eds). *Risks and Reconstruction: Experiences of Resettlers and Refugees*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

de Wet, C.J. (1999). *Regional Paper on Africa*. Report prepared for the World Commission on Dams, Cape Town.

de Wet, C.J. (2001). 'Can Everybody Win? Economic Development and Population Resettlement'. *Economic and Political Weekly* (Mumbai) Vol 36, No 50, pp 4637 – 4646.

de Wet, C. (In Press). "Development-induced displacement and resettlement" In press, in Gibney, M and Hansen, R. (eds) *Global migration: an encyclopedia*. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO.

Dhagamwar, V. 1995 "The NGO movements in the Narmada Valley". In Dreze, J., Samson, M and Singh, S (esd) *The dam and the nation: displacement and resettlement in the Narmada Valley*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press

Downing, T. (1996). 'Mitigating Social Impoverishment when People are Involuntarily Displaced'. In McDowell, C. (ed) *Understanding Impoverishment — The Consequences of Development-Induced Displacement*. Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Dwivedi, R. 1999 'Displacement, risks and resistance: local perceptions and actions in the Sardar Sarovar'. *Development and Change*, 30: 43–78.

- Guenther, M. 2002. 'Ethno-tourism and the Bushmen'. In Stewart, H., Barnard, A. and Omura, K. (ed) *Self and Other-Images of Hunter-Gatherers*. Osaka: National Museum of Ethnology.
- Hakim, R. 2000 'From corn to cotton: changing indicators of food security among resettled Vasavas'. In Cernea, M. and McDowell, C. (eds) *Risks and Reconstruction: Experiences of Resettlers and Refugees*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.
- Jing, J. (1999). *DRRRD Report — China*. Unpublished Report, World Commission on Dams (Cape Town).
- Kala, P. 2001 "In the spaces of erasure: globalisation, resistance and the Narmada River", *Economic and Political Weekly* (Mumbai) June 2, 2001: 1991–2002.
- Meikle, S. and Youxuan, Z. (2000). 'Employment for Displacees in the Socialist Market Economy of China'. In Cernea, M. and McDowell, C. (eds). *Risks and Resettlement: Experiences of Resettlers and Refugees*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.
- Neumann, R.P. 1998 *Imposing wilderness*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Oliver-Smith, O. (2001). *Displacement, Resistance and the Critique of Development: From the Grassroots to the Global*. Unpublished Report, Refugee Studies Centre, University of Oxford.
- Parasuraman, S. (1997). 'The Anti-Dam Movement and Rehabilitation Policy' In Dreze, J. et al (ed 1997). *The Dam and the nation: displacement and resettlement in the Narmada Valley*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Reddy, I. U. B. 1994. *Industrial development and problems of the uprooted*. Jaipur and New Delhi: Rawat Publications.
- Scudder, T. (1993). 'Development-induced relocation and refugee studies'. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 6 (2): 123 – 152.
- Shi, G. and Chen, S. 2000 *China resettlement policies and practices*. Nanjing: National Research Center for Resettlement.
- Smith, A., Malherbe, C., Guenther, M. and Berens, P. 2000. *The Bushmen of South Africa: a foraging society in transition*. Cape Town: David Philip.
- Sorensen, B.R. (1996). *Relocated Lives: Displacement and Resettlement within the Mahaweli Project, Sri Lanka*. Amsterdam: V.U. University Press.
- Suzman, J. 2000. *Things from the bush: a contemporary history of the Omaheke Bushmen*. Basel; Schlettwein Publishing.
- Travers, L. (1993). *China — Involuntary Resettlement*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.
- Trembath, B. et al n.d. *The Shuikou hydroelectric project in China: a case study of successful resettlement*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.
- Turton, D. (2002). 'Forced Displacement and the Nation-State'. In Robinson, J. (ed): *Development and Displacement*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Xiaolangdi reader 2002. Obtainable from Chris de Wet.
- World Bank 1998 *Recent experience with involuntary resettlement: China—Shuikou (and Yantan)*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank. Operations Evaluation Department, Report No. 17539.

World Bank 2002 *Involuntary resettlement- operational policies (OP and BP 4.12)*. Washington, D.C.:The World Bank.

Contact Information for Chris de Wet:

Department of Anthropology
P.O. Box 94
Grahamstown 6140
South Africa
Tele: +27 (0) 46 603-8231
Fax: +27 (0) 46 622-3948
Email: C.dewet@ru.ac.za

